A Perspective on How Glyphosate and 2,4-D May Impact Climate Change

1 Christine M Cornish^{1*} and Jon N Sweetman²

- ² ¹North Dakota State University, Biological Sciences Department, Environmental and Conservation
- 3 Sciences Program, Fargo, ND, USA
- ⁴ ²The Pennsylvania State University, Department of Ecosystem Science and Management, University
- 5 Park, PA, USA
- 6 * Correspondence:
- 7 Christine M Cornish
- 8 christine.cornish@ndsu.edu

9 Keywords: glyphosate, 2,4-D, wetlands, methane, climate change

10 Abstract

11 An increase in herbicide use is occurring due to a growing population and herbicide-resistant crops in agriculture, which has resulted in more herbicide tolerant target species. Glyphosate and 2,4-12 13 Dichlorophenoxyacetic acid (2,4-D) are two of the most commonly used herbicides worldwide and 14 are more recently being used in combination in pre-mixed commercial formulas. Subsequently, 15 herbicide contamination of wetlands will increase subjecting microorganisms to multiple chemical stressors. Methane is a potent greenhouse gas naturally emitted from wetlands, but herbicides may 16 17 disrupt biogeochemical processes leading to an unbalanced methane cycle. This perspective 18 examined the potential effects of herbicides on climate change using glyphosate and 2,4-D as a case 19 study. We highlighted previous research on glyphosate-derived nutrient enrichment and 2,4-D 20 inhibition of methane oxidation. We also explained how the concurrent effects of these herbicides 21 could alter microbial communities leading to increased methane production in wetlands. Our perspective elucidates the potential ecosystem-level implications of herbicides in wetlands, in 22 23 addition to stating the importance for research on the combined effects of herbicides.

24 **1** Introduction

25 Climate change is an ongoing global concern as greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions continue to

26 increase (IPCC, 2021). Methane (CH₄) is the second most abundant GHG, after carbon dioxide

27 (CO₂), but is about 25 times more potent (Islam et al., 2018; EPA, 2023). Wetlands are a large

- 28 natural source of CH₄ as they play a significant role in carbon (C) sequestration and cycling
- 29 (Andresen et al., 2017). It has recently been suggested that GHG emissions from freshwater
- 30 ecosystems may be impacted by agrochemical use (Stehle and Schulz, 2015), which has substantially
- 31 increased over the past 30 years due to the introduction of herbicide-resistant crops. Herbicide-
- 32 resistant crops now comprise more than 90% of crops in the United States (USDA, 2022) and are
- increasingly used worldwide (Peterson et al., 2018). This has unexpectedly led to an increase in

34 herbicide use (Bai and Ogbourne, 2016; Coupe and Capel, 2016), and subsequently weeds are 35 chronically exposed to herbicide residues resulting in the development of herbicide tolerance (Heap and Duke, 2018). For example, the introduction of Roundup Ready[®] (i.e., glyphosate-resistant) crops 36 37 resulted in a 15-fold increase in glyphosate use (Coupe and Capel, 2016; Hébert et al., 2019), and 38 consequently, approximately 41 weed species worldwide have developed glyphosate tolerance 39 (Jeschke and Teten, 2018). Ongoing climatic change is projected to result in intensified herbicide use 40 (Delcour et al., 2015), creating a positive feedback loop if increasing herbicide use results in further 41 CH₄ emissions. Temperature increases can also enhance toxicity and alter biodegradation processes 42 of herbicides (Noves et al., 2009; Koleva and Schneider, 2010; Matzrafi, 2019). Subsequently, as 43 wetlands are subjected to a combination of more severe stressors, wetland biota, specifically 44 microorganisms may be detrimentally affected. Pre-mixed herbicides containing multiple active 45 ingredients (i.e., multiple modes of action), such as glyphosate and 2,4-Dichlorophenoxyacetic acid 46 (2,4-D), are also now more commonly used to combat target species that have developed tolerance to 47 single active ingredient herbicides (Freydier and Lundgren, 2016; Schütte et al., 2017). In this article 48 we will present a case study on how glyphosate and 2,4-D accumulation in wetlands could impact 49 climate change by focusing on their potential synergistic effects on microbial communities. 50 Specifically, understanding their impacts on CH₄ dynamics is critical to understanding the role of 51 wetlands in contributing to climate change.

52 2 Case Study

53 Glyphosate and 2,4-D are two of the most commonly used herbicides and are also used in premixed formulas such as Enlist Duo[®] (1:0.95 glyphosate:2,4-D) and Landmaster[™] II (1:0.83 54 55 glyphosate:2,4-D) (Benbrook, 2016; Zuanazzi et al., 2020; EPA, 2022). Extensive use of glyphosate 56 and 2,4-D are cause for environmental concern within aquatic ecosystems where herbicides are 57 substantial contributors to wetland pollution (Casado et al., 2019). As wetlands are often located in 58 the lowest drainage points of agricultural fields, they can serve as critical sinks for herbicide residues 59 transported through spray drift, runoff, groundwater leaching, and wind and sediment erosion (Annett 60 et al., 2014; Bento et al., 2017). Subsequently, this can result in bioavailable residues, where microorganisms are subjected to a "pesticide cocktail" (Aparicio et al., 2013; Islam et al., 2018). 61 62 Microorganisms, such as prokaryotes and algae, are important contributors to wetland ecosystem 63 functioning, including mediating biogeochemical cycling (Sun et al., 2013; Baker et al., 2020). The C biogeochemical processes of methanogens (i.e., CH4 producers) and methanotrophs (i.e., CH4 64 65 consumers), in addition to plant and algal-mediated transport, play a critical role in the global CH4

66 budget of wetlands. Agrochemical contributions to increased GHG emissions (Stehle and Schulz,

67 2015) may be explained by an unbalanced CH₄ cycle via impacts to CH₄-associated microorganisms.

68 The range of effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D on wetland microorganisms can vary including direct

69 toxicity, nutrient enrichment, and alterations to metabolic and catabolic processes.

70 **2.1 Glyphosate**

71 Glyphosate's potential impacts on wetland microorganisms can be detrimental or advantageous 72 to microbial species. While glyphosate's mode of action was developed to target the shikimate 73 pathway in higher plants (Hetrick and Blankinship, 2015), many archaea and bacteria also utilize this 74 pathway resulting in non-target effects (Herrmann and Weaver, 1999). Despite the potential negative 75 impacts on microorganisms, in many instances increased growth, respiration, and enhanced 76 metabolism in wetland microbial communities have been observed as a result of glyphosate 77 biodegradation (Vera et al., 2012; Lu et al., 2020) and linked with the use of glyphosate as a nutritive 78 source (Saxton et al., 2011; Wang et al., 2016). Due to glyphosate's chemical structure, its 79 degradation often contributes substantial amounts of phosphorus (P), which has been found to be 80 favored and more rapidly utilized by microorganisms compared to other sources of soil P (Hébert et 81 al., 2019; Sun et al., 2019). Specifically, stimulated cyanobacterial growth and cyanotoxin production 82 has been recorded from glyphosate-derived P enrichment (Vera et al., 2010; Qiu et al., 2013; Zhang 83 et al., 2016; Hernández-García and Martínez-Jerónimo, 2020; Wang et al., 2021; Lin et al., 2023). 84 Glyphosate degradation was found to be positively correlated with total P concentrations in surface 85 waters (Carles et al., 2019). Glyphosate additions to aquatic ecosystems can contribute to water 86 quality issues, such as eutrophication, which has been demonstrated to be an important driver of CH₄ 87 emissions (Sepulveda-Jauregui et al., 2018; Beaulieu et al., 2019; Yang et al., 2019; Bertolet et al., 88 2020). In addition, glyphosate-derived P loading into wetlands could stimulate algal biomass leading 89 to eutrophic conditions, which could then increase CH₄ production (Carles et al., 2019). Ultimately, 90 increased glyphosate use could shift microbial community dynamics towards copiotrophs and algae, 91 altering important C biogeochemical processes and resulting in an indirect increase in CH4 92 production in wetlands (Figure 1, panels A and B).

93 **2.2 2,4-D**

Despite 2,4-D being the first synthetic herbicide, compared to glyphosate, relatively little
research has been conducted on its effects on aquatic microorganisms (Donald et al., 2018; Malaj et
al., 2020). However, similar to glyphosate, 2,4-D can have a variety of impacts on wetland microbial

97 communities. It targets broadleaf plants through mimicking the plant growth hormone, indol-3-yl-98 acetic acid (IAA or auxin), resulting in plant overgrowth (Cobb and Reade, 2010), but auxin 99 synthesis and usage in microorganisms is also well known making them vulnerable non-target 100 organisms (Spaepen and Vanderleyden, 2011). In addition, 2,4-D is a widespread environmental 101 contaminant frequently detected in aquatic ecosystems (Malaj et al., 2020), and its use has increased 102 in recent decades with the development of herbicide-resistant crops, where its use will likely continue 103 to increase in the future (Freydier and Lundgren, 2016). Consequently, wetland microorganisms 104 could be highly susceptible to its toxic effects with limited capacity to degrade it. Previous research 105 has found some species use 2,4-D as a C source, whereas other species are toxicologically inhibited 106 (Benndorf et al., 2004; Zabaloy et al., 2008; Sachu et al., 2022). Research in microcosms has also 107 found that increased 2,4-D concentrations resulted in inhibition of CH₄ oxidation, decreases in CH₄ 108 removal time, and increased CH4 emissions (Syamsul Arif et al., 1996; Kumaraswamy et al., 1997; 109 Top et al., 1999). Where studies from Top et al. (1999) and Seghers et al. (2003) suggested decreases 110 in CH₄ removal could be due to 2,4-D inhibition of methanotroph-mediated oxidative metabolism. 111 Research on the effects of 2.4-D on CH₄ oxidation is extremely limited, however these studies do 112 indicate that 2,4-D loading into wetlands could potentially alter the CH₄ cycle by suppressing the 113 removal of CH₄ via the food web, resulting in greater concentrations within the water column and 114 higher emissions (Figure 1, panels C and D).

115 2.3 Pesticide cocktails: Glyphosate plus 2,4-D

116 The increased use of pre-mixed glyphosate and 2,4-D herbicides further exposes wetland 117 microorganisms to combinations of chemical stressors, which could lead to unforeseen long-term 118 effects. Research on the combined effects of pesticides has been conducted since the 1970's, but the 119 majority of the focus has been on the direct toxicological impacts to aquatic flora and fauna 120 (Lichtenstein et al., 1973; Faust et al., 1994; Gardner and Grue, 1996; Hayes et al., 2006; Relyea, 121 2009; Moreira et al., 2020). These studies included compounds such as atrazine, chlorpyrifos, 122 fipronil, etc., whereas research on the combined effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D is limited, especially 123 at the aquatic microbial level. Additive and/or synergistic effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D have been 124 found on fish and amphibian growth, fertilization, survival, and behavior (Carvalho et al., 2020; 125 Pavan et al., 2021; Bernardi et al., 2022; Peluso et al., 2022), and zooplankton emergence (Portinho 126 et al., 2018). Lozano et al. (Lozano et al., 2018) found additive impacts of glyphosate and 2,4-D on 127 phytoplankton composition, abundance, and chlorophyll a after 7 days in microcosms, but also found 128 an antagonist effect on total and live abundance of *Staurastrum* spp. In outdoor mesocosms Lozano

129 et al. (Lozano et al., 2018) found a decrease in phytoplankton respiration and gross primary production from a high glyphosate (applied as Roundup Max[®]), low 2,4-D (applied as AsiMax 50[®]) 130 treatment after 4 hours. Additionally, after 7 days in mesocosms with high glyphosate, an increase in 131 132 primary production, chlorophyll a, and micro- and nanophytoplankton was observed (Lozano et al., 133 2020). Sura et al. (Sura et al., 2015) researched the effects of a herbicide mixture including 134 glyphosate, 2,4-D, and MCPA, clopyralid, dicamba, dichlorprop, mecoprop, and bromoxynil on 135 pelagic and benthic communities in nutrient-sufficient and nutrient-deficient wetlands. They found 136 pelagic bacterial productivity significantly increased after treatment in the nutrient-sufficient wetland, 137 but benthic bacterial productivity did not change, which suggests the stimulatory effect of these 138 herbicides may be related to nutrient bioavailability. These results demonstrate the complexity of the 139 direct effects of herbicide mixtures on aquatic microorganisms, but the potential indirect effects are 140 still poorly understood. As pre-mixed glyphosate and 2,4-D herbicides become more common it is 141 important to consider the extent of their effects on aquatic ecosystems. Glyphosate can easily be used 142 as a nutrient source stimulating microbial activity, specifically algal communities, whereas 2,4-D 143 may inhibit methanotrophic communities from oxidizing CH₄. As these compounds enter aquatic 144 ecosystems their impacts on microorganisms may become synergistic and/or additive resulting in 145 eutrophication and inhibition of methanotrophs from glyphosate and 2,4-D, respectively. 146 Subsequently, eutrophic conditions and decreased CH₄ removal could cause increased CH₄ 147 production via an unbalanced CH₄ cycle (Figure 3).

148 **3 Pollution-Induced Community Tolerance (PICT)**

149 Aquatic ecosystems are subjected to year-round herbicide contamination, where herbicide use 150 differs across crop, season, habitat, and region. Microorganism structure and function can be 151 impacted by herbicides, but toxicity is often dependent on the mode of action, concentration, and 152 duration of exposure, as well as microbial species and environmental factors (DeLorenzo et al., 153 2001). For example, glyphosate stimulated Chlorella vulgaris growth 24-hours after exposure, but 154 then inhibited growth after 48-hours at the same concentrations (i.e., hormesis) (Reno et al., 2014). In 155 addition to the duration of exposure, the exposure to a different mode of action could also impact 156 microorganisms by causing a community shift often appearing as changes in gene expression or 157 diversity (Feld et al., 2015). Pollution-Induced Community Tolerance (PICT) refers to the response 158 of a community to a pollutant, which results in an increased tolerance to that pollutant (Blanck, 159 2002). The use of PICT analysis is extensive in the toxicology literature, especially on phototrophic 160 microorganisms, which are often more susceptible to herbicidal effects due to their similarities with

161 target species (DeLorenzo et al., 2001; Larras et al., 2016). Bérard and Benninghoff (Bérard and 162 Benninghoff, 2001) found phytoplankton were significantly more sensitive to atrazine after one day, 163 but then significantly less sensitive after at least 11 days. Phototrophic biofilms were found to be 164 increasingly more sensitive to diuron as contamination levels decreased 1-3 years after its ban in the 165 European Union (Pesce et al., 2016). It has also been shown that selection pressure from multiple stressors can lead to more opportunistic species and higher tolerances (Rotter et al., 2013). 166 167 Ultimately, PICT results suggest that more sensitive species are being replaced by less sensitive 168 species creating a more tolerant community (Blanck, 2002). This has also been seen with both 169 glyphosate and 2,4-D. Microbial communities from sediments with high glyphosate exposure were 170 able to degrade glyphosate faster and had higher diversity compared to sediments with low to no 171 previous exposure (Tang et al., 2019). Zabaloy et al. (Zabaloy et al., 2008) saw an increase in a 2,4-D 172 degrading population in soils for approximately one month after treatment and found that agricultural 173 soils had higher 2,4-D tolerance compared to reference soils via PICT analysis. In a study by de 174 Lipthay et al. (de Lipthay et al., 2002) 2,4-D treatment induced transcription of the gene responsible 175 for 2,4-D degradation (*tfdA*) which demonstrates a survival response from the microbial community. 176 These studies demonstrate PICT can occur when communities are exposed to a herbicide, therefore 177 contamination by an additional herbicide could further alter communities that have not been exposed 178 before. It could be presumed that wetland microbial communities within a glyphosate-dominant 179 region may substantially change when 2,4-D is introduced in combination with glyphosate and 180 species are replaced. This potential shift would impact the biogeochemical functions of the 181 community, subsequently altering herbicide degradation or metabolism.

182 4 Conclusions

183 Glyphosate and 2,4-D are frequently cited as having minimal to no environmental impacts 184 (Peterson et al., 2016; Duke, 2020; Singh et al., 2020), however there is increasing evidence that their 185 indirect effects may be of more substantial global concern. Wetlands naturally emit CH₄ via 186 diffusion, ebullition (i.e., bubbles), and plant-mediated transport, and are the highest natural sources 187 of CH₄ in the environment (Aben et al., 2017; Andresen et al., 2017), but emissions may be 188 increasing due to agrochemical use adversely impacting CH₄ sink potential (Seghers et al., 2005). 189 Glyphosate could stimulate microbial processes resulting in increased CH₄ production, in addition to 190 2,4-D inhibiting CH₄ oxidation further resulting in increased CH₄ production. Ultimately, this would 191 lead to higher CH₄ production versus removal from freshwater creating elevated CH₄ in the 192 atmosphere. Due to the widespread and extensive use of glyphosate and 2,4-D, these contaminants

- are frequently found in wetlands (Islam et al., 2018; Malaj et al., 2020). To our knowledge there has
- been no research investigating the combined impacts of glyphosate and 2,4-D on wetland microbial
- 195 communities. The potential bottom-up effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D could be detrimental to a
- 196 changing climate, thus improving our understanding of how these herbicides can impact GHG
- 197 emissions is crucial.

198 4.1 Future Research

199 To investigate the effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D on CH₄ emissions from freshwater 200 ecosystems, micro- or mesocosm experiments could be conducted. Experiments under controlled 201 conditions could help determine how wetland microbial communities are affected by glyphosate and 202 2,4-D. Specifically, this research would give insight into the CH₄-related mechanisms that may be 203 enhanced or disrupted in microorganisms. In addition to in-lab research, pesticide loading data could 204 be incorporated into GHG models. These data are currently not included in estimations of CH4 205 emissions from wetlands, but could be an important source of variation, and could be useful for 206 future climate modeling. These potential impacts are crucial to research as herbicide use is only 207 expected to increase over time, where chemical selection pressure on microbial communities could 208 contribute to climate change.

209 **5 References**

- Aben, R. C. H., Barros, N., van Donk, E., Frenken, T., Hilt, S., Kazanjian, G., et al. (2017). Cross
 continental increase in methane ebullition under climate change. *Nature Communications* 8, 1682. doi: 10.1038/s41467-017-01535-y.
- Andresen, C. G., Lara, M. J., Tweedie, C. E., and Lougheed, V. L. (2017). Rising plant-mediated
 methane emissions from arctic wetlands. *Global Change Biology* 23, 1128–1139. doi:
 10.1111/gcb.13469.
- Annett, R., Habibi, H. R., and Hontela, A. (2014). Impact of glyphosate and glyphosate-based
 herbicides on the freshwater environment: Impact of glyphosate-based herbicides. *J. Appl. Toxicol.* 34, 458–479. doi: 10.1002/jat.2997.
- Aparicio, V. C., De Gerónimo, E., Marino, D., Primost, J., Carriquiriborde, P., and Costa, J. L.
 (2013). Environmental fate of glyphosate and aminomethylphosphonic acid in surface waters
 and soil of agricultural basins. *Chemosphere* 93, 1866–1873. doi:
 10.1016/j.chemosphere.2013.06.041.
- Bai, S. H., and Ogbourne, S. M. (2016). Glyphosate: environmental contamination, toxicity and
 potential risks to human health via food contamination. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 23, 18988–
 19001. doi: 10.1007/s11356-016-7425-3.

- Baker, B. J., De Anda, V., Seitz, K. W., Dombrowski, N., Santoro, A. E., and Lloyd, K. G. (2020).
 Diversity, ecology and evolution of Archaea. *Nat Microbiol* 5, 887–900. doi:
 10.1038/s41564-020-0715-z.
- Beaulieu, J. J., DelSontro, T., and Downing, J. A. (2019). Eutrophication will increase methane
 emissions from lakes and impoundments during the 21st century. *Nat Commun* 10, 1375. doi:
 10.1038/s41467-019-09100-5.
- Benbrook, C. M. (2016). Trends in glyphosate herbicide use in the United States and globally.
 Environ Sci Eur 28, 3. doi: 10.1186/s12302-016-0070-0.
- Benndorf, D., Davidson, I., and Babel, W. (2004). Regulation of catabolic enzymes during long-term
 exposure of Delftia acidovorans MC1 to chlorophenoxy herbicides. *Microbiology* 150, 1005–
 1014. doi: 10.1099/mic.0.26774-0.
- Bento, C. P. M., Goossens, D., Rezaei, M., Riksen, M., Mol, H. G. J., Ritsema, C. J., et al. (2017).
 Glyphosate and AMPA distribution in wind-eroded sediment derived from loess soil. *Environmental Pollution* 220, 1079–1089. doi: 10.1016/j.envpol.2016.11.033.
- Bérard, A., and Benninghoff, C. (2001). Pollution-induced community tolerance (PICT) and seasonal
 variations in the sensitivity of phytoplankton to atrazine in nanocosms. *Chemosphere* 45,
 427–437. doi: 10.1016/S0045-6535(01)00063-7.
- Bernardi, F., Lirola, J. R., Cestari, M. M., and Bombardelli, R. A. (2022). Effects on reproductive,
 biochemical and genotoxic parameters of herbicides 2,4-D and glyphosate in silver catfish
 (Rhamdia quelen). *Environmental Toxicology and Pharmacology* 89, 103787. doi:
 10.1016/j.etap.2021.103787.
- Bertolet, B. L., Olson, C. R., Szydlowski, D. K., Solomon, C. T., and Jones, S. E. (2020). Methane
 and Primary Productivity in Lakes: Divergence of Temporal and Spatial Relationships. *J. Geophys. Res. Biogeosci.* 125. doi: 10.1029/2020JG005864.
- Blanck, H. (2002). A Critical Review of Procedures and Approaches Used for Assessing Pollution Induced Community Tolerance (PICT) in Biotic Communities. *Human and Ecological Risk Assessment: An International Journal* 8, 1003–1034. doi: 10.1080/1080-700291905792.
- Carles, L., Gardon, H., Joseph, L., Sanchís, J., Farré, M., and Artigas, J. (2019). Meta-analysis of
 glyphosate contamination in surface waters and dissipation by biofilms. *Environment International* 124, 284–293. doi: 10.1016/j.envint.2018.12.064.
- Carvalho, W. F., Ruiz De Arcaute, C., Torres, L., De Melo E Silva, D., Soloneski, S., and
 Larramendy, M. L. (2020). Genotoxicity of mixtures of glyphosate with 2,4dichlorophenoxyacetic acid chemical forms towards Cnesterodon decemmaculatus (Pisces,
 Poeciliidae). *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 27, 6515–6525. doi: 10.1007/s11356-019-07379-x.
- Casado, J., Brigden, K., Santillo, D., and Johnston, P. (2019). Screening of pesticides and veterinary
 drugs in small streams in the European Union by liquid chromatography high resolution mass
 spectrometry. *Science of The Total Environment* 670, 1204–1225. doi:
 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.03.207.

- Cobb, A. H., and Reade, J. P. H. (2010). *Herbicides and Plant Physiology: Cobb/Herbicides and Plant Physiology*. Oxford, UK: Wiley-Blackwell Available at:
 http://doi.wiley.com/10.1002/9781444327793 [Accessed June 14, 2022].
- Coupe, R. H., and Capel, P. D. (2016). Trends in pesticide use on soybean, corn and cotton since the
 introduction of major genetically modified crops in the United States: Pesticide use on US
 soybean, corn and cotton since the introduction of GM crops. *Pest. Manag. Sci.* 72, 1013–
 1022. doi: 10.1002/ps.4082.
- de Lipthay, J. R., Aamand, J., and Barkay, T. (2002). Expression of tfdA genes in aquatic microbial
 communities during acclimation to 2,4-dichlorophenoxyacetic acid. *FEMS Microbiology Ecology* 40, 205–214. doi: 10.1111/j.1574-6941.2002.tb00953.x.
- Delcour, I., Spanoghe, P., and Uyttendaele, M. (2015). Literature review: Impact of climate change
 on pesticide use. *Food Research International* 68, 7–15. doi: 10.1016/j.foodres.2014.09.030.
- DeLorenzo, M. E., Scott, G. I., and Ross, P. E. (2001). Toxicity of pesticides to aquatic
 microorganisms: A review. *Environ Toxicol Chem* 20, 84–98. doi: 10.1002/etc.5620200108.
- Donald, D. B., Cessna, A. J., and Farenhorst, A. (2018). Concentrations of Herbicides in Wetlands on
 Organic and Minimum-Tillage Farms. *J. Environ. Qual.* 47, 1554–1565. doi:
 10.2134/jeq2018.03.0100.
- 281 Duke, S. O. (2020). Glyphosate: environmental fate and impact. *Weed Sci* 68, 201–207. doi: 10.1017/wsc.2019.28.
- 283 EPA (2022). Registration of Enlist One and Enlist Duo. Available at:
 284 https://www.epa.gov/ingredients-used-pesticide-products/registration-enlist-one-and-enlist 285 duo.
- EPA (2023). Overview of Greenhouse Gases. *Greenhouse Gas Emissions*. Available at:
 https://www.epa.gov/ghgemissions/overview-greenhouse-gases.
- Faust, M., Altenburger, R., Boedeker, W., and Grimme, L. H. (1994). Algal toxicity of binary
 combinations of pesticides. *Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol.* 53. doi: 10.1007/BF00205150.
- Feld, L., Hjelmsø, M. H., Nielsen, M. S., Jacobsen, A. D., Rønn, R., Ekelund, F., et al. (2015).
 Pesticide Side Effects in an Agricultural Soil Ecosystem as Measured by amoA Expression
 Quantification and Bacterial Diversity Changes. *PLoS ONE* 10, e0126080. doi:
 10.1371/journal.pone.0126080.
- Freydier, L., and Lundgren, J. G. (2016). Unintended effects of the herbicides 2,4-D and dicamba on
 lady beetles. *Ecotoxicology* 25, 1270–1277. doi: 10.1007/s10646-016-1680-4.
- Gardner, S. C., and Grue, C. E. (1996). Effects of rodeo® and garlon® 3A on nontarget wetland
 species in central Washington. *Environ Toxicol Chem* 15, 441–451. doi:
 10.1002/etc.5620150406.

- Hayes, T. B., Case, P., Chui, S., Chung, D., Haeffele, C., Haston, K., et al. (2006). Pesticide
 Mixtures, Endocrine Disruption, and Amphibian Declines: Are We Underestimating the
 Impact? *Environ Health Perspect* 114, 40–50. doi: 10.1289/ehp.8051.
- Heap, I., and Duke, S. O. (2018). Overview of glyphosate-resistant weeds worldwide: Overview of
 glyphosate-resistant weeds. *Pest. Manag. Sci* 74, 1040–1049. doi: 10.1002/ps.4760.
- Hébert, M.-P., Fugère, V., and Gonzalez, A. (2019). The overlooked impact of rising glyphosate use
 on phosphorus loading in agricultural watersheds. *Front Ecol Environ* 17, 48–56. doi:
 10.1002/fee.1985.
- Hernández-García, C. I., and Martínez-Jerónimo, F. (2020). Multistressor negative effects on an
 experimental phytoplankton community. The case of glyphosate and one toxigenic
 cyanobacterium on Chlorophycean microalgae. *Science of The Total Environment* 717,
 137186. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.137186.
- Herrmann, K. M., and Weaver, L. M. (1999). THE SHIKIMATE PATHWAY. Annu Rev Plant
 Physiol Plant Mol Biol 50, 473–503. doi: 10.1146/annurev.arplant.50.1.473.
- Hetrick, J., and Blankinship, A. (2015). Preliminary Ecological Risk Assessment in Support of the
 Registration Review of Glyphosate and Its Salts. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency:
 Office of Chemical Safety and Pollution Prevention.
- IPCC (2021). IPCC, 2021: Climate Change 2021: The Physical Science Basis, the Working Group I
 contribution to the Sixth Assessment Report. Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York,
 NY, USA: Cambridge University Press.
- Islam, F., Wang, J., Farooq, M. A., Khan, M. S. S., Xu, L., Zhu, J., et al. (2018). Potential impact of
 the herbicide 2,4-dichlorophenoxyacetic acid on human and ecosystems. *Environment International* 111, 332–351. doi: 10.1016/j.envint.2017.10.020.
- 322 Jeschke, M., and Teten, S. (2018). Glyphosate-Resistant Weeds in North America. 10.
- Koleva, N. G., and Schneider, U. >A. (2010). The impact of climate change on aquatic risk from
 agricultural pesticides in the US. *International Journal of Environmental Studies* 67, 677–
 704. doi: 10.1080/00207233.2010.507477.
- Kumaraswamy, S., Ramakrishnan, B., Satpathy, S. N., Rath, A. K., Misra, S., Rao, V. R., et al.
 (1997). Spatial distribution of methane-oxidizing activity in a flooded rice soil. *Plant and Soil*191, 241–248. doi: 10.1023/A:1004274302326.
- Larras, F., Rimet, F., Gregorio, V., Bérard, A., Leboulanger, C., Montuelle, B., et al. (2016).
 Pollution-induced community tolerance (PICT) as a tool for monitoring Lake Geneva longterm in situ ecotoxic restoration from herbicide contamination. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 23, 4301–4311. doi: 10.1007/s11356-015-5302-0.
- Lichtenstein, E. P., Liang, T. T., and Anderegg, B. N. (1973). Synergism of Insecticides by
 Herbicides. *Science* 181, 847–849. doi: 10.1126/science.181.4102.847.

- Lin, W., Zhang, Z., Chen, Y., Zhang, Q., Ke, M., Lu, T., et al. (2023). The mechanism of different
 cyanobacterial responses to glyphosate. *Journal of Environmental Sciences* 125, 258–265.
 doi: 10.1016/j.jes.2021.11.039.
- Lozano, V. L., Allen Dohle, S., Vera, M. S., Torremorell, A., and Pizarro, H. N. (2020). Primary
 production of freshwater microbial communities is affected by a cocktail of herbicides in an
 outdoor experiment. *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety* 201, 110821. doi:
 10.1016/j.ecoenv.2020.110821.
- Lozano, V. L., Vinocur, A., Sabio y García, C. A., Allende, L., Cristos, D. S., Rojas, D., et al. (2018).
 Effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D mixture on freshwater phytoplankton and periphyton
 communities: a microcosms approach. *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety* 148, 1010–
 1019. doi: 10.1016/j.ecoenv.2017.12.006.
- Lu, T., Xu, N., Zhang, Q., Zhang, Z., Debognies, A., Zhou, Z., et al. (2020). Understanding the
 influence of glyphosate on the structure and function of freshwater microbial community in a
 microcosm. *Environmental Pollution* 260, 114012. doi: 10.1016/j.envpol.2020.114012.
- Malaj, E., Liber, K., and Morrissey, C. A. (2020). Spatial distribution of agricultural pesticide use
 and predicted wetland exposure in the Canadian Prairie Pothole Region. *Science of The Total Environment* 718, 134765. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.134765.
- Matzrafi, M. (2019). Climate change exacerbates pest damage through reduced pesticide efficacy.
 Pest Management Science 75, 9–13. doi: 10.1002/ps.5121.
- Moreira, R. A., Rocha, G. S., Da Silva, L. C. M., Goulart, B. V., Montagner, C. C., Melão, M. D. G.
 G., et al. (2020). Exposure to environmental concentrations of fipronil and 2,4-D mixtures
 causes physiological, morphological and biochemical changes in Raphidocelis subcapitata.
 Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety 206, 111180. doi: 10.1016/j.ecoenv.2020.111180.
- Noyes, P. D., McElwee, M. K., Miller, H. D., Clark, B. W., Van Tiem, L. A., Walcott, K. C., et al.
 (2009). The toxicology of climate change: Environmental contaminants in a warming world. *Environment International* 35, 971–986. doi: 10.1016/j.envint.2009.02.006.
- Pavan, F. A., Samojeden, C. G., Rutkoski, C. F., Folador, A., Da Fré, S. P., Müller, C., et al. (2021).
 Morphological, behavioral and genotoxic effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D mixture in tadpoles
 of two native species of South American amphibians. *Environmental Toxicology and Pharmacology* 85, 103637. doi: 10.1016/j.etap.2021.103637.
- Peluso, J., Furió Lanuza, A., Pérez Coll, C. S., and Aronzon, C. M. (2022). Synergistic effects of
 glyphosate- and 2,4-D-based pesticides mixtures on Rhinella arenarum larvae. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 29, 14443–14452. doi: 10.1007/s11356-021-16784-0.
- Pesce, S., Margoum, C., and Foulquier, A. (2016). Pollution-induced community tolerance for in situ
 assessment of recovery in river microbial communities following the ban of the herbicide
 diuron. Agriculture, Ecosystems & Environment 221, 79–86. doi: 10.1016/j.agee.2016.01.009.
- Peterson, M. A., Collavo, A., Ovejero, R., Shivrain, V., and Walsh, M. J. (2018). The challenge of
 herbicide resistance around the world: a current summary. *Pest Management Science* 74,
 2246–2259. doi: 10.1002/ps.4821.

374 Peterson, M. A., McMaster, S. A., Riechers, D. E., Skelton, J., and Stahlman, P. W. (2016). 2,4-D 375 Past, Present, and Future: A Review. Weed technol. 30, 303-345. doi: 10.1614/WT-D-15-376 00131.1. 377 Portinho, J. L., Nielsen, D. L., Daré, L., Henry, R., Oliveira, R. C., and Branco, C. C. Z. (2018). 378 Mixture of commercial herbicides based on 2,4-D and glyphosate mixture can suppress the 379 emergence of zooplankton from sediments. Chemosphere 203, 151-159. doi: 380 10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.03.156. 381 Qiu, H., Geng, J., Ren, H., Xia, X., Wang, X., and Yu, Y. (2013). Physiological and biochemical 382 responses of Microcystis aeruginosa to glyphosate and its Roundup® formulation. Journal of 383 Hazardous Materials 248-249, 172-176. doi: 10.1016/j.jhazmat.2012.12.033. 384 Relyea, R. A. (2009). A cocktail of contaminants: how mixtures of pesticides at low concentrations 385 affect aquatic communities. Oecologia 159, 363–376. doi: 10.1007/s00442-008-1213-9. 386 Reno, U., Gutierrez, M. F., Regaldo, L., and Gagneten, A. M. (2014). The Impact of Eskoba®, a 387 Glyphosate Formulation, on the Freshwater Plankton Community. water environ res 86, 388 2294-2300. doi: 10.2175/106143014X13896437493580. 389 Rotter, S., Heilmeier, H., Altenburger, R., and Schmitt-Jansen, M. (2013). Multiple stressors in 390 periphyton - comparison of observed and predicted tolerance responses to high ionic loads 391 and herbicide exposure. J Appl Ecol 50, 1459–1468. doi: 10.1111/1365-2664.12146. 392 Sachu, M., Kynshi, B. L., and Syiem, M. B. (2022). A biochemical, physiological and molecular evaluation of how the herbicide 2, 4-dichlorophenoxyacetic acid intercedes photosynthesis 393 394 and diazotrophy in the cyanobacterium Nostoc muscorum Meg 1. Environ Sci Pollut Res 29, 36684-36698. doi: 10.1007/s11356-021-18000-5. 395 396 Saxton, M. A., Morrow, E. A., Bourbonniere, R. A., and Wilhelm, S. W. (2011). Glyphosate influence on phytoplankton community structure in Lake Erie. Journal of Great Lakes 397 398 Research 37, 683–690. doi: 10.1016/j.jglr.2011.07.004. 399 Schütte, G., Eckerstorfer, M., Rastelli, V., Reichenbecher, W., Restrepo-Vassalli, S., Ruohonen-400 Lehto, M., et al. (2017). Herbicide resistance and biodiversity: agronomic and environmental 401 aspects of genetically modified herbicide-resistant plants. Environ Sci Eur 29, 5. doi: 402 10.1186/s12302-016-0100-y. 403 Seghers, D., Siciliano, S. D., Top, E. M., and Verstraete, W. (2005). Combined effect of fertilizer and 404 herbicide applications on the abundance, community structure and performance of the soil 405 methanotrophic community. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 37, 187-193. doi: 406 10.1016/j.soilbio.2004.05.025. 407 Sepulveda-Jauregui, A., Hoyos-Santillan, J., Martinez-Cruz, K., Walter Anthony, K. M., Casper, P., 408 Belmonte-Izquierdo, Y., et al. (2018). Eutrophication exacerbates the impact of climate 409 warming on lake methane emission. Science of The Total Environment 636, 411-419. doi: 410 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.04.283.

- 411 Singh, S., Kumar, V., Gill, J. P. K., Datta, S., Singh, S., Dhaka, V., et al. (2020). Herbicide
 412 Glyphosate: Toxicity and Microbial Degradation. *IJERPH* 17, 7519. doi:
 413 10.3390/ijerph17207519.
- 414 Spaepen, S., and Vanderleyden, J. (2011). Auxin and Plant-Microbe Interactions. *Cold Spring* 415 *Harbor Perspectives in Biology* 3, a001438–a001438. doi: 10.1101/cshperspect.a001438.
- 416 Stehle, S., and Schulz, R. (2015). Agricultural insecticides threaten surface waters at the global scale.
 417 *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 112, 5750–5755. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1500232112.
- Sun, K., Liu, W., Liu, L., Wang, N., and Duan, S. (2013). Ecological risks assessment of
 organophosphorus pesticides on bloom of Microcystis wesenbergii. *International Biodeterioration & Biodegradation* 77, 98–105. doi: 10.1016/j.ibiod.2012.11.010.
- Sun, M., Li, H., and Jaisi, D. P. (2019). Degradation of glyphosate and bioavailability of phosphorus
 derived from glyphosate in a soil-water system. *Water Research* 163, 114840. doi:
 10.1016/j.watres.2019.07.007.
- Sura, S., Waiser, M. J., Tumber, V., Raina-Fulton, R., and Cessna, A. J. (2015). Effects of a herbicide
 mixture on primary and bacterial productivity in four prairie wetlands with varying salinities:
 An enclosure approach. *Science of The Total Environment* 512–513, 526–539. doi:
 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2015.01.064.
- 428 Syamsul Arif, M. A., Houwen, F., and Verstraete, W. (1996). Agricultural factors affecting methane
 429 oxidation in arable soil. *Biol Fertil Soils* 21, 95–102. doi: 10.1007/BF00335999.
- Tang, F. H. M., Jeffries, T. C., Vervoort, R. W., Conoley, C., Coleman, N. V., and Maggi, F. (2019).
 Microcosm experiments and kinetic modeling of glyphosate biodegradation in soils and
 sediments. *Science of The Total Environment* 658, 105–115. doi:
 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.12.179.
- Top, E. M., Maila, M. P., Clerinx, M., Goris, J., Vos, P., and Verstraete, W. (1999). Methane
 oxidation as a method to evaluate the removal of 2,4-dichlorophenoxyactic acid (2,4-D) from
 soil by plasmid-mediated bioaugmentation. *FEMS Microbiology Ecology* 28, 203–213. doi:
 10.1111/j.1574-6941.1999.tb00576.x.
- USDA (2022). Recent Trends in GE Adoption. Adoption of Genetically Engineered crops in the U.S.
 Available at: https://www.ers.usda.gov/data-products/adoption-of-genetically-engineered crops-in-the-u-s/recent-trends-in-ge-adoption/.
- Vera, M. S., Di Fiori, E., Lagomarsino, L., Sinistro, R., Escaray, R., Iummato, M. M., et al. (2012).
 Direct and indirect effects of the glyphosate formulation Glifosato Atanor® on freshwater
 microbial communities. *Ecotoxicology* 21, 1805–1816. doi: 10.1007/s10646-012-0915-2.
- Vera, M. S., Lagomarsino, L., Sylvester, M., Pérez, G. L., Rodríguez, P., Mugni, H., et al. (2010).
 New evidences of Roundup® (glyphosate formulation) impact on the periphyton community and the water quality of freshwater ecosystems. *Ecotoxicology* 19, 710–721. doi: 10.1007/s10646-009-0446-7.

- Wang, S., Seiwert, B., Kästner, M., Miltner, A., Schäffer, A., Reemtsma, T., et al. (2016).
 (Bio)degradation of glyphosate in water-sediment microcosms A stable isotope co-labeling approach. *Water Research* 99, 91–100. doi: 10.1016/j.watres.2016.04.041.
- Wang, W., Jiang, M., and Sheng, Y. (2021). Glyphosate Accelerates the Proliferation of Microcystis
 aeruginosa, a Dominant Species in Cyanobacterial Blooms. *Environ Toxicol Chem* 40, 342–
 351. doi: 10.1002/etc.4942.
- Yang, Y., Chen, J., Tong, T., Li, B., He, T., Liu, Y., et al. (2019). Eutrophication influences
 methanotrophic activity, abundance and community structure in freshwater lakes. *Science of The Total Environment* 662, 863–872. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.01.307.
- Zabaloy, M. C., Garland, J. L., and Gómez, M. A. (2008). An integrated approach to evaluate the
 impacts of the herbicides glyphosate, 2,4-D and metsulfuron-methyl on soil microbial
 communities in the Pampas region, Argentina. *Applied Soil Ecology* 40, 1–12. doi:
 10.1016/j.apsoil.2008.02.004.
- Zhang, Q., Zhou, H., Li, Z., Zhu, J., Zhou, C., and Zhao, M. (2016). Effects of glyphosate at
 environmentally relevant concentrations on the growth of and microcystin production by
 Microcystis aeruginosa. *Environ Monit Assess* 188, 632. doi: 10.1007/s10661-016-5627-2.
- Zuanazzi, N. R., Ghisi, N. de C., and Oliveira, E. C. (2020). Analysis of global trends and gaps for
 studies about 2,4-D herbicide toxicity: A scientometric review. *Chemosphere* 241, 125016.
 doi: 10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.125016.
- 467 **Conflict of Interest**
- 468 This manuscript was written in the absence of commercial or financial conflicts of interest.

469 **6** Author Contributions

470 Christine Cornish generated the first draft of the manuscript with revisions and comments from Jon471 Sweetman. Both authors have read and approved the submitted version.

472 **7 Funding**

473 No funding was received for this manuscript.

474 8 Acknowledgments

Thank you to Dr. Ted Harris for reviewing this manuscript, and for his ongoing support as acommittee member to CM Cornish.

477 9 Data Availability Statement

478 Not applicable.



479

- 480 Figure 1. Conceptual diagrams of a wetland with methanogens, methanotrophs, and algae. (A)
- 481 represents balanced CH₄ production; (**B**) represents glyphosate contamination stimulating
- 482 methanogens and algae causing higher CH₄ emissions; (C) represents balanced CH₄ oxidation; (D)
- 483 represents 2,4-D contamination inhibiting oxidation (i.e., removal) of CH₄ by methanotrophs causing
- 484 higher CH₄ emissions.



485

Figure 2. Conceptual diagrams of a wetland with methanogens, methanotrophs, and algae. Panel (A)
 represents a balanced CH₄ cycle, where algae and methanogens produce CH₄, methanotrophs oxidize
 CH₄; panel (B) represents an unbalanced CH₄ cycle where glyphosate and 2,4-D contamination

- stimulate methanogens and algae and inhibit CH4 oxidation, respectively, and thus result in higher CH4 emissions.