## A Perspective on How Glyphosate and 2,4-D May Impact Climate Change

#### Christine M Cornish<sup>1\*</sup> and Jon N Sweetman<sup>2</sup> 1

- 2 <sup>1</sup>North Dakota State University, Biological Sciences Department, Environmental and Conservation
- 3 Sciences Program, Fargo, ND, USA
- 4 <sup>2</sup>The Pennsylvania State University, Department of Ecosystem Science and Management, University
- 5 Park, PA, USA
- 6 \* Correspondence:
- Christine M Cornish 7
- 8 christine.cornish@ndsu.edu

#### Keywords: glyphosate, 2,4-D, wetlands, methane, climate change 9

#### 10 Abstract

- 11 An increase in herbicide use is occurring due to a growing population and herbicide-resistant crops in
- agriculture, which has resulted in more herbicide tolerant target species. Glyphosate and 2,4-12
- 13 Dichlorophenoxyacetic acid (2,4-D) are two of the most commonly used herbicides worldwide and
- 14 are more recently being used in combination in pre-mixed commercial formulas. Subsequently,
- 15 herbicide contamination of wetlands will increase subjecting microorganisms to multiple chemical
- stressors. Methane is a potent greenhouse gas naturally emitted from wetlands, but herbicides may 16
- 17 disrupt biogeochemical processes leading to an unbalanced methane cycle. This perspective
- 18 examined the potential effects of herbicides on climate change using glyphosate and 2,4-D as a case
- 19 study. We highlighted previous research on glyphosate-derived nutrient enrichment and 2,4-D
- 20 inhibition of methane oxidation. We also explained how the concurrent effects of these herbicides 21
- could alter microbial communities leading to increased methane production in wetlands. Our
- perspective elucidates the potential ecosystem-level implications of herbicides in wetlands, in 22
- 23 addition to stating the importance for research on the combined effects of herbicides.

#### 24 1 Introduction

25 Climate change is an ongoing global concern as greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions continue to increase (IPCC, 2021). Methane (CH<sub>4</sub>) is the second most abundant GHG, after carbon dioxide 26 (CO<sub>2</sub>), but is about 25 times more potent (Islam et al., 2018; EPA, 2023). Wetlands are a large 27 28 natural source of CH4 as they play a significant role in carbon (C) sequestration and cycling (Andresen et al., 2017). It has recently been suggested that GHG emissions from freshwater 29 30 ecosystems may be impacted by agrochemical use (Stehle and Schulz, 2015), which has substantially increased over the past 30 years due to the introduction of herbicide-resistant crops. Herbicide-31 resistant crops now comprise more than 90% of crops in the United States (USDA, 2022) and are 32 increasingly used worldwide (Peterson et al., 2018). This has unexpectedly led to an increase in 33 34 herbicide use (Bai and Ogbourne, 2016; Coupe and Capel, 2016), and subsequently weeds are chronically exposed to herbicide residues resulting in the development of herbicide tolerance (Heap 35 and Duke, 2018). For example, the introduction of Roundup Ready<sup>®</sup> (i.e., glyphosate-resistant) crops 36 resulted in a 15-fold increase in glyphosate use (Coupe and Capel, 2016; Hébert et al., 2019), and 37

38 consequently, approximately 41 weed species worldwide have developed glyphosate tolerance

- 39 (Jeschke and Teten, 2018). Ongoing climatic change is projected to result in intensified herbicide use
- 40 (Delcour et al., 2015), creating a positive feedback loop if increasing herbicide use results in further
- 41 CH<sub>4</sub> emissions. Temperature increases can also enhance toxicity and alter biodegradation processes
- 42 of herbicides (Noyes et al., 2009; Koleva and Schneider, 2010; Matzrafi, 2019). Subsequently, as
- 43 wetlands are subjected to a combination of more severe stressors, wetland biota, specifically
- 44 microorganisms may be detrimentally affected. Pre-mixed herbicides containing multiple active
   45 ingredients (i.e., multiple modes of action), such as glyphosate and 2,4-Dichlorophenoxyacetic acid
- 46 (2,4-D), are also now more commonly used to combat target species that have developed tolerance to
- 47 single active ingredient herbicides (Freydier and Lundgren, 2016; Schütte et al., 2017). In this article
- 48 we will present a case study on how glyphosate and 2,4-D accumulation in wetlands could impact
- 49 climate change by focusing on their potential synergistic effects on microbial communities.
- 50 Specifically, understanding their impacts on CH4 dynamics is critical to understanding the role of
- 51 wetlands in contributing to climate change.

## 52 2 Case Study

53 Glyphosate and 2,4-D are two of the most commonly used herbicides and are also used in premixed formulas such as Enlist Duo<sup>®</sup> (1:0.95 glyphosate:2,4-D) and Landmaster<sup>™</sup> II (1:0.83 54 glyphosate:2,4-D) (Benbrook, 2016; Zuanazzi et al., 2020; EPA, 2022). Extensive use of glyphosate 55 56 and 2,4-D are cause for environmental concern within aquatic ecosystems where herbicides are 57 substantial contributors to wetland pollution (Casado et al., 2019). As wetlands are often located in 58 the lowest drainage points of agricultural fields, they can serve as critical sinks for herbicide residues 59 transported through spray drift, runoff, groundwater leaching, and wind and sediment erosion (Annett 60 et al., 2014; Bento et al., 2017). Subsequently, this can result in bioavailable residues, where 61 microorganisms are subjected to a "pesticide cocktail" (Aparicio et al., 2013; Islam et al., 2018). Microorganisms, such as prokaryotes and algae, are important contributors to wetland ecosystem 62 functioning, including mediating biogeochemical cycling (Sun et al., 2013; Baker et al., 2020). The C 63 64 biogeochemical processes of methanogens (i.e., CH4 producers) and methanotrophs (i.e., CH4 consumers), in addition to plant and algal-mediated transport, play a critical role in the global CH4 65 budget of wetlands. Agrochemical contributions to increased GHG emissions (Stehle and Schulz, 66 2015) may be explained by an unbalanced CH<sub>4</sub> cycle via impacts to CH<sub>4</sub>-associated microorganisms. 67 68 The range of effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D on wetland microorganisms can vary including direct 69 toxicity, nutrient enrichment, and alterations to metabolic and catabolic processes.

## 70 2.1 Glyphosate

71 Glyphosate's potential impacts on wetland microorganisms can be detrimental or advantageous 72 to microbial species. While glyphosate's mode of action was developed to target the shikimate 73 pathway in higher plants (Hetrick and Blankinship, 2015), many archaea and bacteria also utilize this 74 pathway resulting in non-target effects (Herrmann and Weaver, 1999). Despite the potential negative 75 impacts on microorganisms, in many instances increased growth, respiration, and enhanced 76 metabolism in wetland microbial communities have been observed as a result of glyphosate 77 biodegradation (Vera et al., 2012; Lu et al., 2020) and linked with the use of glyphosate as a nutritive 78 source (Saxton et al., 2011; Wang et al., 2016). Due to glyphosate's chemical structure, its 79 degradation often contributes substantial amounts of phosphorus (P), which has been found to be favored and more rapidly utilized by microorganisms compared to other sources of soil P (Hébert et 80 81 al., 2019; Sun et al., 2019). Specifically, stimulated cyanobacterial growth and cyanotoxin production 82 has been recorded from glyphosate-derived P enrichment (Vera et al., 2010; Qiu et al., 2013; Zhang

- et al., 2016; Hernández-García and Martínez-Jerónimo, 2020; Wang et al., 2021; Lin et al., 2023).
- 84 Glyphosate degradation was found to be positively correlated with total P concentrations in surface
- 85 waters (Carles et al., 2019). Glyphosate additions to aquatic ecosystems can contribute to water
- quality issues, such as eutrophication, which has been demonstrated to be an important driver of CH<sub>4</sub>
- 87 emissions (Sepulveda-Jauregui et al., 2018; Beaulieu et al., 2019; Yang et al., 2019; Bertolet et al.,
- 2020). In addition, glyphosate-derived P loading into wetlands could stimulate algal biomass leading
   to eutrophic conditions, which could then increase CH<sub>4</sub> production (Carles et al., 2019). Ultimately,
- 90 increased glyphosate use could shift microbial community dynamics towards copiotrophs and algae,
- 91 altering important C biogeochemical processes and resulting in an indirect increase in CH<sub>4</sub>
- 92 production in wetlands (Figure 1, panels A and B).

#### 93 **2.2 2,4-D**

94 Despite 2,4-D being the first synthetic herbicide, compared to glyphosate, relatively little 95 research has been conducted on its effects on aquatic microorganisms (Donald et al., 2018; Malaj et al., 2020). However, similar to glyphosate, 2,4-D can have a variety of impacts on wetland microbial 96 97 communities. It targets broadleaf plants through mimicking the plant growth hormone, indol-3-yl-98 acetic acid (IAA or auxin), resulting in plant overgrowth (Cobb and Reade, 2010), but auxin 99 synthesis and usage in microorganisms is also well known making them vulnerable non-target 100 organisms (Spaepen and Vanderleyden, 2011). In addition, 2,4-D is a widespread environmental 101 contaminant frequently detected in aquatic ecosystems (Malaj et al., 2020), and its use has increased 102 in recent decades with the development of herbicide-resistant crops, where its use will likely continue 103 to increase in the future (Freydier and Lundgren, 2016). Consequently, wetland microorganisms 104 could be highly susceptible to its toxic effects with limited capacity to degrade it. Previous research 105 has found some species use 2,4-D as a C source, whereas other species are toxicologically inhibited 106 (Benndorf et al., 2004; Zabalov et al., 2008; Sachu et al., 2022). Research in microcosms has also 107 found that increased 2,4-D concentrations resulted in inhibition of CH4 oxidation, decreases in CH4 108 removal time, and increased CH<sub>4</sub> emissions (Syamsul Arif et al., 1996; Kumaraswamy et al., 1997; 109 Top et al., 1999). Where studies from Top et al. (1999) and Seghers et al. (2003) suggested decreases 110 in CH<sub>4</sub> removal could be due to 2,4-D inhibition of methanotroph-mediated oxidative metabolism. 111 Research on the effects of 2,4-D on CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation is extremely limited, however these studies do 112 indicate that 2,4-D loading into wetlands could potentially alter the CH<sub>4</sub> cycle by suppressing the 113 removal of CH<sub>4</sub> via the food web, resulting in greater concentrations within the water column and higher emissions (Figure 1, panels C and D). 114

#### 115 2.3 Pesticide cocktails: Glyphosate plus 2,4-D

The increased use of pre-mixed glyphosate and 2,4-D herbicides further exposes wetland 116 117 microorganisms to combinations of chemical stressors, which could lead to unforeseen long-term 118 effects. Research on the combined effects of pesticides has been conducted since the 1970's, but the 119 majority of the focus has been on the direct toxicological impacts to aquatic flora and fauna (Lichtenstein et al., 1973; Faust et al., 1994; Gardner and Grue, 1996; Hayes et al., 2006; Relyea, 120 121 2009; Moreira et al., 2020). These studies included compounds such as atrazine, chlorpyrifos, fipronil, etc., whereas research on the combined effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D is limited, especially 122 at the aquatic microbial level. Additive and/or synergistic effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D have been 123 124 found on fish and amphibian growth, fertilization, survival, and behavior (Carvalho et al., 2020; 125 Pavan et al., 2021; Bernardi et al., 2022; Peluso et al., 2022), and zooplankton emergence (Portinho 126 et al., 2018). Lozano et al. (Lozano et al., 2018) found additive impacts of glyphosate and 2,4-D on 127 phytoplankton composition, abundance, and chlorophyll a after 7 days in microcosms, but also found

128 an antagonist effect on total and live abundance of *Staurastrum* spp. In outdoor mesocosms Lozano 129 et al. (Lozano et al., 2018) found a decrease in phytoplankton respiration and gross primary production from a high glyphosate (applied as Roundup Max<sup>®</sup>), low 2,4-D (applied as AsiMax 50<sup>®</sup>) 130 treatment after 4 hours. Additionally, after 7 days in mesocosms with high glyphosate, an increase in 131 132 primary production, chlorophyll a, and micro- and nanophytoplankton was observed (Lozano et al., 133 2020). Sura et al. (Sura et al., 2015) researched the effects of a herbicide mixture including glyphosate, 2,4-D, and MCPA, clopyralid, dicamba, dichlorprop, mecoprop, and bromoxynil on 134 pelagic and benthic communities in nutrient-sufficient and nutrient-deficient wetlands. They found 135 pelagic bacterial productivity significantly increased after treatment in the nutrient-sufficient wetland, 136 137 but benthic bacterial productivity did not change, which suggests the stimulatory effect of these herbicides may be related to nutrient bioavailability. These results demonstrate the complexity of the 138 139 direct effects of herbicide mixtures on aquatic microorganisms, but the potential indirect effects are 140 still poorly understood. As pre-mixed glyphosate and 2.4-D herbicides become more common it is 141 important to consider the extent of their effects on aquatic ecosystems. Glyphosate can easily be used 142 as a nutrient source stimulating microbial activity, specifically algal communities, whereas 2,4-D 143 may inhibit methanotrophic communities from oxidizing CH<sub>4</sub>. As these compounds enter aquatic 144 ecosystems their impacts on microorganisms may become synergistic and/or additive resulting in 145 eutrophication and inhibition of methanotrophs from glyphosate and 2,4-D, respectively. 146 Subsequently, eutrophic conditions and decreased CH<sub>4</sub> removal could cause increased CH<sub>4</sub>

147 production via an unbalanced CH<sub>4</sub> cycle (Figure 2).

#### 148 **3 Pollution-Induced Community Tolerance (PICT)**

149 Aquatic ecosystems are subjected to year-round herbicide contamination, where herbicide use 150 differs across crop, season, habitat, and region. Microorganism structure and function can be 151 impacted by herbicides, but toxicity is often dependent on the mode of action, concentration, and duration of exposure, as well as microbial species and environmental factors (DeLorenzo et al., 152 2001). For example, glyphosate stimulated *Chlorella vulgaris* growth 24-hours after exposure, but 153 154 then inhibited growth after 48-hours at the same concentrations (i.e., hormesis) (Reno et al., 2014). In addition to the duration of exposure, the exposure to a different mode of action could also impact 155 156 microorganisms by causing a community shift often appearing as changes in gene expression or 157 diversity (Feld et al., 2015). Pollution-Induced Community Tolerance (PICT) refers to the response of a community to a pollutant, which results in an increased tolerance to that pollutant (Blanck, 158 159 2002). The use of PICT analysis is extensive in the toxicology literature, especially on phototrophic 160 microorganisms, which are often more susceptible to herbicidal effects due to their similarities with target species (DeLorenzo et al., 2001; Larras et al., 2016). Bérard and Benninghoff (Bérard and 161 162 Benninghoff, 2001) found phytoplankton were significantly more sensitive to atrazine after one day, 163 but then significantly less sensitive after at least 11 days. Phototrophic biofilms were found to be 164 increasingly more sensitive to diuron as contamination levels decreased 1-3 years after its ban in the 165 European Union (Pesce et al., 2016). It has also been shown that selection pressure from multiple stressors can lead to more opportunistic species and higher tolerances (Rotter et al., 2013). 166 167 Ultimately, PICT results suggest that more sensitive species are being replaced by less sensitive species creating a more tolerant community (Blanck, 2002). This has also been seen with both 168 169 glyphosate and 2.4-D. Microbial communities from sediments with high glyphosate exposure were able to degrade glyphosate faster and had higher diversity compared to sediments with low to no 170 previous exposure (Tang et al., 2019). Zabaloy et al. (Zabaloy et al., 2008) saw an increase in a 2,4-D 171 degrading population in soils for approximately one month after treatment and found that agricultural 172 173 soils had higher 2,4-D tolerance compared to reference soils via PICT analysis. In a study by de Lipthay et al. (de Lipthay et al., 2002) 2,4-D treatment induced transcription of the gene responsible 174

175 for 2,4-D degradation (*tfdA*) which demonstrates a survival response from the microbial community.

- 176 These studies demonstrate PICT can occur when communities are exposed to a herbicide, therefore
- 177 contamination by an additional herbicide could further alter communities that have not been exposed
- before. It could be presumed that wetland microbial communities within a glyphosate-dominant
- region may substantially change when 2,4-D is introduced in combination with glyphosate and
- 180 species are replaced. This potential shift would impact the biogeochemical functions of the
- 181 community, subsequently altering herbicide degradation or metabolism.

### 182 **4** Conclusions

183 Glyphosate and 2,4-D are frequently cited as having minimal to no environmental impacts 184 (Peterson et al., 2016; Duke, 2020; Singh et al., 2020), however there is increasing evidence that their 185 indirect effects may be of more substantial global concern. Wetlands naturally emit CH<sub>4</sub> via diffusion, ebullition (i.e., bubbles), and plant-mediated transport, and are the highest natural sources 186 187 of CH<sub>4</sub> in the environment (Aben et al., 2017; Andresen et al., 2017), but emissions may be increasing due to agrochemical use adversely impacting CH<sub>4</sub> sink potential (Seghers et al., 2005). 188 189 Glyphosate could stimulate microbial processes resulting in increased CH<sub>4</sub> production, in addition to 190 2,4-D inhibiting CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation further resulting in increased CH<sub>4</sub> production. Ultimately, this would 191 lead to higher CH<sub>4</sub> production versus removal from freshwater creating elevated CH<sub>4</sub> in the 192 atmosphere. Due to the widespread and extensive use of glyphosate and 2,4-D, these contaminants 193 are frequently found in wetlands (Islam et al., 2018; Malaj et al., 2020). To our knowledge there has 194 been no research investigating the combined impacts of glyphosate and 2,4-D on wetland microbial 195 communities. The potential bottom-up effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D could be detrimental to a 196 changing climate, thus improving our understanding of how these herbicides can impact GHG 197 emissions is crucial.

#### 198 4.1 Future Research

199 To investigate the effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D on CH<sub>4</sub> emissions from freshwater 200 ecosystems, micro- or mesocosm experiments could be conducted. Experiments under controlled conditions could help determine how wetland microbial communities are affected by glyphosate and 201 202 2,4-D. Specifically, this research would give insight into the CH<sub>4</sub>-related mechanisms that may be 203 enhanced or disrupted in microorganisms. In addition to in-lab research, pesticide loading data could 204 be incorporated into GHG models. These data are currently not included in estimations of CH4 205 emissions from wetlands, but could be an important source of variation, and could be useful for 206 future climate modeling. These potential impacts are crucial to research as herbicide use is only 207 expected to increase over time, where chemical selection pressure on microbial communities could 208 contribute to climate change.

#### 209 **5 References**

- Aben, R. C. H., Barros, N., van Donk, E., Frenken, T., Hilt, S., Kazanjian, G., et al. (2017). Cross
  continental increase in methane ebullition under climate change. *Nature Communications* 8, 1682. doi: 10.1038/s41467-017-01535-y.
- Andresen, C. G., Lara, M. J., Tweedie, C. E., and Lougheed, V. L. (2017). Rising plant-mediated
  methane emissions from arctic wetlands. *Global Change Biology* 23, 1128–1139. doi:
  10.1111/gcb.13469.

- Annett, R., Habibi, H. R., and Hontela, A. (2014). Impact of glyphosate and glyphosate-based
   herbicides on the freshwater environment: Impact of glyphosate-based herbicides. J. Appl.
   *Toxicol.* 34, 458–479. doi: 10.1002/jat.2997.
- Aparicio, V. C., De Gerónimo, E., Marino, D., Primost, J., Carriquiriborde, P., and Costa, J. L.
  (2013). Environmental fate of glyphosate and aminomethylphosphonic acid in surface waters
  and soil of agricultural basins. *Chemosphere* 93, 1866–1873. doi:
  10.1016/j.chemosphere.2013.06.041.
- Bai, S. H., and Ogbourne, S. M. (2016). Glyphosate: environmental contamination, toxicity and
  potential risks to human health via food contamination. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 23, 18988–
  19001. doi: 10.1007/s11356-016-7425-3.
- Baker, B. J., De Anda, V., Seitz, K. W., Dombrowski, N., Santoro, A. E., and Lloyd, K. G. (2020).
  Diversity, ecology and evolution of Archaea. *Nat Microbiol* 5, 887–900. doi:
  10.1038/s41564-020-0715-z.
- Beaulieu, J. J., DelSontro, T., and Downing, J. A. (2019). Eutrophication will increase methane
  emissions from lakes and impoundments during the 21st century. *Nat Commun* 10, 1375. doi:
  10.1038/s41467-019-09100-5.
- Benbrook, C. M. (2016). Trends in glyphosate herbicide use in the United States and globally.
   *Environ Sci Eur* 28, 3. doi: 10.1186/s12302-016-0070-0.
- Benndorf, D., Davidson, I., and Babel, W. (2004). Regulation of catabolic enzymes during long-term
   exposure of Delftia acidovorans MC1 to chlorophenoxy herbicides. *Microbiology* 150, 1005–
   1014. doi: 10.1099/mic.0.26774-0.
- Bento, C. P. M., Goossens, D., Rezaei, M., Riksen, M., Mol, H. G. J., Ritsema, C. J., et al. (2017).
  Glyphosate and AMPA distribution in wind-eroded sediment derived from loess soil. *Environmental Pollution* 220, 1079–1089. doi: 10.1016/j.envpol.2016.11.033.
- Bérard, A., and Benninghoff, C. (2001). Pollution-induced community tolerance (PICT) and seasonal
  variations in the sensitivity of phytoplankton to atrazine in nanocosms. *Chemosphere* 45,
  427–437. doi: 10.1016/S0045-6535(01)00063-7.
- Bernardi, F., Lirola, J. R., Cestari, M. M., and Bombardelli, R. A. (2022). Effects on reproductive,
  biochemical and genotoxic parameters of herbicides 2,4-D and glyphosate in silver catfish
  (Rhamdia quelen). *Environmental Toxicology and Pharmacology* 89, 103787. doi:
  10.1016/j.etap.2021.103787.
- Bertolet, B. L., Olson, C. R., Szydlowski, D. K., Solomon, C. T., and Jones, S. E. (2020). Methane
   and Primary Productivity in Lakes: Divergence of Temporal and Spatial Relationships. *J. Geophys. Res. Biogeosci.* 125. doi: 10.1029/2020JG005864.

## Blanck, H. (2002). A Critical Review of Procedures and Approaches Used for Assessing Pollution Induced Community Tolerance (PICT) in Biotic Communities. *Human and Ecological Risk Assessment: An International Journal* 8, 1003–1034. doi: 10.1080/1080-700291905792.

- Carles, L., Gardon, H., Joseph, L., Sanchís, J., Farré, M., and Artigas, J. (2019). Meta-analysis of
   glyphosate contamination in surface waters and dissipation by biofilms. *Environment International* 124, 284–293. doi: 10.1016/j.envint.2018.12.064.
- Carvalho, W. F., Ruiz De Arcaute, C., Torres, L., De Melo E Silva, D., Soloneski, S., and
   Larramendy, M. L. (2020). Genotoxicity of mixtures of glyphosate with 2,4 dichlorophenoxyacetic acid chemical forms towards Cnesterodon decemmaculatus (Pisces,
   Poeciliidae). *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 27, 6515–6525. doi: 10.1007/s11356-019-07379-x.
- Casado, J., Brigden, K., Santillo, D., and Johnston, P. (2019). Screening of pesticides and veterinary
   drugs in small streams in the European Union by liquid chromatography high resolution mass
   spectrometry. *Science of The Total Environment* 670, 1204–1225. doi:
   10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.03.207.
- Cobb, A. H., and Reade, J. P. H. (2010). *Herbicides and Plant Physiology: Cobb/Herbicides and Plant Physiology*. Oxford, UK: Wiley-Blackwell Available at:
   http://doi.wiley.com/10.1002/9781444327793 [Accessed June 14, 2022].
- Coupe, R. H., and Capel, P. D. (2016). Trends in pesticide use on soybean, corn and cotton since the
  introduction of major genetically modified crops in the United States: Pesticide use on US
  soybean, corn and cotton since the introduction of GM crops. *Pest. Manag. Sci.* 72, 1013–
  1022. doi: 10.1002/ps.4082.
- de Lipthay, J. R., Aamand, J., and Barkay, T. (2002). Expression of tfdA genes in aquatic microbial
   communities during acclimation to 2,4-dichlorophenoxyacetic acid. *FEMS Microbiology Ecology* 40, 205–214. doi: 10.1111/j.1574-6941.2002.tb00953.x.
- Delcour, I., Spanoghe, P., and Uyttendaele, M. (2015). Literature review: Impact of climate change
   on pesticide use. *Food Research International* 68, 7–15. doi: 10.1016/j.foodres.2014.09.030.
- DeLorenzo, M. E., Scott, G. I., and Ross, P. E. (2001). Toxicity of pesticides to aquatic
   microorganisms: A review. *Environ Toxicol Chem* 20, 84–98. doi: 10.1002/etc.5620200108.
- Donald, D. B., Cessna, A. J., and Farenhorst, A. (2018). Concentrations of Herbicides in Wetlands on
  Organic and Minimum-Tillage Farms. *J. Environ. Qual.* 47, 1554–1565. doi:
  10.2134/jeq2018.03.0100.
- 281 Duke, S. O. (2020). Glyphosate: environmental fate and impact. *Weed Sci* 68, 201–207. doi:
   282 10.1017/wsc.2019.28.
- EPA (2022). Registration of Enlist One and Enlist Duo. Available at:
   https://www.epa.gov/ingredients-used-pesticide-products/registration-enlist-one-and-enlist duo.
- EPA (2023). Overview of Greenhouse Gases. *Greenhouse Gas Emissions*. Available at:
   https://www.epa.gov/ghgemissions/overview-greenhouse-gases.
- Faust, M., Altenburger, R., Boedeker, W., and Grimme, L. H. (1994). Algal toxicity of binary
  combinations of pesticides. *Bull. Environ. Contam. Toxicol.* 53. doi: 10.1007/BF00205150.

- Feld, L., Hjelmsø, M. H., Nielsen, M. S., Jacobsen, A. D., Rønn, R., Ekelund, F., et al. (2015).
  Pesticide Side Effects in an Agricultural Soil Ecosystem as Measured by amoA Expression
  Quantification and Bacterial Diversity Changes. *PLoS ONE* 10, e0126080. doi:
  10.1371/journal.pone.0126080.
- Freydier, L., and Lundgren, J. G. (2016). Unintended effects of the herbicides 2,4-D and dicamba on
   lady beetles. *Ecotoxicology* 25, 1270–1277. doi: 10.1007/s10646-016-1680-4.
- Gardner, S. C., and Grue, C. E. (1996). Effects of rodeo® and garlon® 3A on nontarget wetland
   species in central Washington. *Environ Toxicol Chem* 15, 441–451. doi:
   10.1002/etc.5620150406.
- Hayes, T. B., Case, P., Chui, S., Chung, D., Haeffele, C., Haston, K., et al. (2006). Pesticide
  Mixtures, Endocrine Disruption, and Amphibian Declines: Are We Underestimating the
  Impact? *Environ Health Perspect* 114, 40–50. doi: 10.1289/ehp.8051.
- Heap, I., and Duke, S. O. (2018). Overview of glyphosate-resistant weeds worldwide: Overview of glyphosate-resistant weeds. *Pest. Manag. Sci* 74, 1040–1049. doi: 10.1002/ps.4760.
- Hébert, M.-P., Fugère, V., and Gonzalez, A. (2019). The overlooked impact of rising glyphosate use
  on phosphorus loading in agricultural watersheds. *Front Ecol Environ* 17, 48–56. doi:
  10.1002/fee.1985.
- Hernández-García, C. I., and Martínez-Jerónimo, F. (2020). Multistressor negative effects on an
  experimental phytoplankton community. The case of glyphosate and one toxigenic
  cyanobacterium on Chlorophycean microalgae. *Science of The Total Environment* 717,
  137186. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.137186.
- Herrmann, K. M., and Weaver, L. M. (1999). THE SHIKIMATE PATHWAY. Annu Rev Plant
   Physiol Plant Mol Biol 50, 473–503. doi: 10.1146/annurev.arplant.50.1.473.
- Hetrick, J., and Blankinship, A. (2015). Preliminary Ecological Risk Assessment in Support of the
   Registration Review of Glyphosate and Its Salts. U.S. Environmental Protection Agency:
   Office of Chemical Safety and Pollution Prevention.
- IPCC (2021). IPCC, 2021: Climate Change 2021: The Physical Science Basis, the Working Group I
   contribution to the Sixth Assessment Report. Cambridge, United Kingdom and New York,
   NY, USA: Cambridge University Press.
- Islam, F., Wang, J., Farooq, M. A., Khan, M. S. S., Xu, L., Zhu, J., et al. (2018). Potential impact of
   the herbicide 2,4-dichlorophenoxyacetic acid on human and ecosystems. *Environment International* 111, 332–351. doi: 10.1016/j.envint.2017.10.020.
- 322 Jeschke, M., and Teten, S. (2018). Glyphosate-Resistant Weeds in North America. 10.
- Koleva, N. G., and Schneider, U. >A. (2010). The impact of climate change on aquatic risk from
   agricultural pesticides in the US. *International Journal of Environmental Studies* 67, 677–
   704. doi: 10.1080/00207233.2010.507477.

- Kumaraswamy, S., Ramakrishnan, B., Satpathy, S. N., Rath, A. K., Misra, S., Rao, V. R., et al.
  (1997). Spatial distribution of methane-oxidizing activity in a flooded rice soil. *Plant and Soil*191, 241–248. doi: 10.1023/A:1004274302326.
- Larras, F., Rimet, F., Gregorio, V., Bérard, A., Leboulanger, C., Montuelle, B., et al. (2016).
  Pollution-induced community tolerance (PICT) as a tool for monitoring Lake Geneva longterm in situ ecotoxic restoration from herbicide contamination. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 23, 4301–4311. doi: 10.1007/s11356-015-5302-0.
- Lichtenstein, E. P., Liang, T. T., and Anderegg, B. N. (1973). Synergism of Insecticides by
   Herbicides. *Science* 181, 847–849. doi: 10.1126/science.181.4102.847.
- Lin, W., Zhang, Z., Chen, Y., Zhang, Q., Ke, M., Lu, T., et al. (2023). The mechanism of different
  cyanobacterial responses to glyphosate. *Journal of Environmental Sciences* 125, 258–265.
  doi: 10.1016/j.jes.2021.11.039.
- Lozano, V. L., Allen Dohle, S., Vera, M. S., Torremorell, A., and Pizarro, H. N. (2020). Primary
   production of freshwater microbial communities is affected by a cocktail of herbicides in an
   outdoor experiment. *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety* 201, 110821. doi:
   10.1016/j.ecoenv.2020.110821.
- Lozano, V. L., Vinocur, A., Sabio y García, C. A., Allende, L., Cristos, D. S., Rojas, D., et al. (2018).
  Effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D mixture on freshwater phytoplankton and periphyton
  communities: a microcosms approach. *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety* 148, 1010–
  1019. doi: 10.1016/j.ecoenv.2017.12.006.
- Lu, T., Xu, N., Zhang, Q., Zhang, Z., Debognies, A., Zhou, Z., et al. (2020). Understanding the
  influence of glyphosate on the structure and function of freshwater microbial community in a
  microcosm. *Environmental Pollution* 260, 114012. doi: 10.1016/j.envpol.2020.114012.
- Malaj, E., Liber, K., and Morrissey, C. A. (2020). Spatial distribution of agricultural pesticide use
   and predicted wetland exposure in the Canadian Prairie Pothole Region. *Science of The Total Environment* 718, 134765. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.134765.
- Matzrafi, M. (2019). Climate change exacerbates pest damage through reduced pesticide efficacy.
   *Pest Management Science* 75, 9–13. doi: 10.1002/ps.5121.
- Moreira, R. A., Rocha, G. S., Da Silva, L. C. M., Goulart, B. V., Montagner, C. C., Melão, M. D. G.
   G., et al. (2020). Exposure to environmental concentrations of fipronil and 2,4-D mixtures
   causes physiological, morphological and biochemical changes in Raphidocelis subcapitata.
   *Ecotoxicology and Environmental Safety* 206, 111180. doi: 10.1016/j.ecoenv.2020.111180.
- Noyes, P. D., McElwee, M. K., Miller, H. D., Clark, B. W., Van Tiem, L. A., Walcott, K. C., et al.
  (2009). The toxicology of climate change: Environmental contaminants in a warming world. *Environment International* 35, 971–986. doi: 10.1016/j.envint.2009.02.006.
- Pavan, F. A., Samojeden, C. G., Rutkoski, C. F., Folador, A., Da Fré, S. P., Müller, C., et al. (2021).
  Morphological, behavioral and genotoxic effects of glyphosate and 2,4-D mixture in tadpoles
  of two native species of South American amphibians. *Environmental Toxicology and Pharmacology* 85, 103637. doi: 10.1016/j.etap.2021.103637.

- Peluso, J., Furió Lanuza, A., Pérez Coll, C. S., and Aronzon, C. M. (2022). Synergistic effects of
   glyphosate- and 2,4-D-based pesticides mixtures on Rhinella arenarum larvae. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 29, 14443–14452. doi: 10.1007/s11356-021-16784-0.
- Pesce, S., Margoum, C., and Foulquier, A. (2016). Pollution-induced community tolerance for in situ
   assessment of recovery in river microbial communities following the ban of the herbicide
   diuron. Agriculture, Ecosystems & Environment 221, 79–86. doi: 10.1016/j.agee.2016.01.009.
- Peterson, M. A., Collavo, A., Ovejero, R., Shivrain, V., and Walsh, M. J. (2018). The challenge of
   herbicide resistance around the world: a current summary. *Pest Management Science* 74,
   2246–2259. doi: 10.1002/ps.4821.
- Peterson, M. A., McMaster, S. A., Riechers, D. E., Skelton, J., and Stahlman, P. W. (2016). 2,4-D
   Past, Present, and Future: A Review. *Weed technol.* 30, 303–345. doi: 10.1614/WT-D-15 00131.1.
- Portinho, J. L., Nielsen, D. L., Daré, L., Henry, R., Oliveira, R. C., and Branco, C. C. Z. (2018).
  Mixture of commercial herbicides based on 2,4-D and glyphosate mixture can suppress the
  emergence of zooplankton from sediments. *Chemosphere* 203, 151–159. doi:
  10.1016/j.chemosphere.2018.03.156.
- Qiu, H., Geng, J., Ren, H., Xia, X., Wang, X., and Yu, Y. (2013). Physiological and biochemical
   responses of Microcystis aeruginosa to glyphosate and its Roundup® formulation. *Journal of Hazardous Materials* 248–249, 172–176. doi: 10.1016/j.jhazmat.2012.12.033.
- Relyea, R. A. (2009). A cocktail of contaminants: how mixtures of pesticides at low concentrations
   affect aquatic communities. *Oecologia* 159, 363–376. doi: 10.1007/s00442-008-1213-9.
- Reno, U., Gutierrez, M. F., Regaldo, L., and Gagneten, A. M. (2014). The Impact of Eskoba®, a
  Glyphosate Formulation, on the Freshwater Plankton Community. *water environ res* 86,
  2294–2300. doi: 10.2175/106143014X13896437493580.
- Rotter, S., Heilmeier, H., Altenburger, R., and Schmitt-Jansen, M. (2013). Multiple stressors in
   periphyton comparison of observed and predicted tolerance responses to high ionic loads
   and herbicide exposure. *J Appl Ecol* 50, 1459–1468. doi: 10.1111/1365-2664.12146.
- Sachu, M., Kynshi, B. L., and Syiem, M. B. (2022). A biochemical, physiological and molecular
  evaluation of how the herbicide 2, 4-dichlorophenoxyacetic acid intercedes photosynthesis
  and diazotrophy in the cyanobacterium Nostoc muscorum Meg 1. *Environ Sci Pollut Res* 29,
  36684–36698. doi: 10.1007/s11356-021-18000-5.
- Saxton, M. A., Morrow, E. A., Bourbonniere, R. A., and Wilhelm, S. W. (2011). Glyphosate
   influence on phytoplankton community structure in Lake Erie. *Journal of Great Lakes Research* 37, 683–690. doi: 10.1016/j.jglr.2011.07.004.

# Schütte, G., Eckerstorfer, M., Rastelli, V., Reichenbecher, W., Restrepo-Vassalli, S., RuohonenLehto, M., et al. (2017). Herbicide resistance and biodiversity: agronomic and environmental aspects of genetically modified herbicide-resistant plants. *Environ Sci Eur* 29, 5. doi: 10.1186/s12302-016-0100-y.

- Seghers, D., Siciliano, S. D., Top, E. M., and Verstraete, W. (2005). Combined effect of fertilizer and herbicide applications on the abundance, community structure and performance of the soil methanotrophic community. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry* 37, 187–193. doi: 10.1016/j.soilbio.2004.05.025.
- 407 Sepulveda-Jauregui, A., Hoyos-Santillan, J., Martinez-Cruz, K., Walter Anthony, K. M., Casper, P.,
  408 Belmonte-Izquierdo, Y., et al. (2018). Eutrophication exacerbates the impact of climate
  409 warming on lake methane emission. *Science of The Total Environment* 636, 411–419. doi:
  410 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.04.283.
- 411 Singh, S., Kumar, V., Gill, J. P. K., Datta, S., Singh, S., Dhaka, V., et al. (2020). Herbicide
  412 Glyphosate: Toxicity and Microbial Degradation. *IJERPH* 17, 7519. doi:
  413 10.3390/ijerph17207519.
- 414 Spaepen, S., and Vanderleyden, J. (2011). Auxin and Plant-Microbe Interactions. *Cold Spring* 415 *Harbor Perspectives in Biology* 3, a001438–a001438. doi: 10.1101/cshperspect.a001438.
- 416 Stehle, S., and Schulz, R. (2015). Agricultural insecticides threaten surface waters at the global scale.
   417 *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 112, 5750–5755. doi: 10.1073/pnas.1500232112.
- Sun, K., Liu, W., Liu, L., Wang, N., and Duan, S. (2013). Ecological risks assessment of
  organophosphorus pesticides on bloom of Microcystis wesenbergii. *International Biodeterioration & Biodegradation* 77, 98–105. doi: 10.1016/j.ibiod.2012.11.010.
- Sun, M., Li, H., and Jaisi, D. P. (2019). Degradation of glyphosate and bioavailability of phosphorus
  derived from glyphosate in a soil-water system. *Water Research* 163, 114840. doi:
  10.1016/j.watres.2019.07.007.
- Sura, S., Waiser, M. J., Tumber, V., Raina-Fulton, R., and Cessna, A. J. (2015). Effects of a herbicide
  mixture on primary and bacterial productivity in four prairie wetlands with varying salinities:
  An enclosure approach. *Science of The Total Environment* 512–513, 526–539. doi:
  10.1016/j.scitotenv.2015.01.064.
- 428 Syamsul Arif, M. A., Houwen, F., and Verstraete, W. (1996). Agricultural factors affecting methane
  429 oxidation in arable soil. *Biol Fertil Soils* 21, 95–102. doi: 10.1007/BF00335999.
- Tang, F. H. M., Jeffries, T. C., Vervoort, R. W., Conoley, C., Coleman, N. V., and Maggi, F. (2019).
  Microcosm experiments and kinetic modeling of glyphosate biodegradation in soils and
  sediments. *Science of The Total Environment* 658, 105–115. doi:
  10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.12.179.
- Top, E. M., Maila, M. P., Clerinx, M., Goris, J., Vos, P., and Verstraete, W. (1999). Methane
  oxidation as a method to evaluate the removal of 2,4-dichlorophenoxyactic acid (2,4-D) from
  soil by plasmid-mediated bioaugmentation. *FEMS Microbiology Ecology* 28, 203–213. doi:
  10.1111/j.1574-6941.1999.tb00576.x.
- USDA (2022). Recent Trends in GE Adoption. Adoption of Genetically Engineered crops in the U.S.
   Available at: https://www.ers.usda.gov/data-products/adoption-of-genetically-engineered crops-in-the-u-s/recent-trends-in-ge-adoption/.

- Vera, M. S., Di Fiori, E., Lagomarsino, L., Sinistro, R., Escaray, R., Iummato, M. M., et al. (2012).
  Direct and indirect effects of the glyphosate formulation Glifosato Atanor® on freshwater
  microbial communities. *Ecotoxicology* 21, 1805–1816. doi: 10.1007/s10646-012-0915-2.
- Vera, M. S., Lagomarsino, L., Sylvester, M., Pérez, G. L., Rodríguez, P., Mugni, H., et al. (2010).
  New evidences of Roundup® (glyphosate formulation) impact on the periphyton community and the water quality of freshwater ecosystems. *Ecotoxicology* 19, 710–721. doi: 10.1007/s10646-009-0446-7.
- Wang, S., Seiwert, B., Kästner, M., Miltner, A., Schäffer, A., Reemtsma, T., et al. (2016).
  (Bio)degradation of glyphosate in water-sediment microcosms A stable isotope co-labeling approach. *Water Research* 99, 91–100. doi: 10.1016/j.watres.2016.04.041.
- Wang, W., Jiang, M., and Sheng, Y. (2021). Glyphosate Accelerates the Proliferation of Microcystis
  aeruginosa, a Dominant Species in Cyanobacterial Blooms. *Environ Toxicol Chem* 40, 342–
  351. doi: 10.1002/etc.4942.
- Yang, Y., Chen, J., Tong, T., Li, B., He, T., Liu, Y., et al. (2019). Eutrophication influences
  methanotrophic activity, abundance and community structure in freshwater lakes. *Science of The Total Environment* 662, 863–872. doi: 10.1016/j.scitotenv.2019.01.307.
- Zabaloy, M. C., Garland, J. L., and Gómez, M. A. (2008). An integrated approach to evaluate the
  impacts of the herbicides glyphosate, 2,4-D and metsulfuron-methyl on soil microbial
  communities in the Pampas region, Argentina. *Applied Soil Ecology* 40, 1–12. doi:
  10.1016/j.apsoil.2008.02.004.
- Zhang, Q., Zhou, H., Li, Z., Zhu, J., Zhou, C., and Zhao, M. (2016). Effects of glyphosate at
  environmentally relevant concentrations on the growth of and microcystin production by
  Microcystis aeruginosa. *Environ Monit Assess* 188, 632. doi: 10.1007/s10661-016-5627-2.
- Zuanazzi, N. R., Ghisi, N. de C., and Oliveira, E. C. (2020). Analysis of global trends and gaps for
  studies about 2,4-D herbicide toxicity: A scientometric review. *Chemosphere* 241, 125016.
  doi: 10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.125016.

#### 467 6 Conflict of Interest

468 This manuscript was written in the absence of commercial or financial conflicts of interest.

#### 469 **7** Author Contributions

470 Christine Cornish generated the first draft of the manuscript with revisions and comments from Jon471 Sweetman. Both authors have read and approved the submitted version.

#### 472 **8 Funding**

473 No funding was received for this manuscript.

#### 474 **9** Acknowledgments

Thank you to Dr. Ted Harris for reviewing this manuscript, and for his ongoing support as acommittee member to CM Cornish.

#### 477 10 Data Availability Statement

- 478 Not applicable.
- 479 **Figure 1.** Conceptual diagrams of a wetland with methanogens, methanotrophs, and algae. (A)
- 480 represents balanced CH<sub>4</sub> production; (**B**) represents glyphosate contamination stimulating
- 481 methanogens and algae causing higher CH<sub>4</sub> emissions; (C) represents balanced CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation; (D)
- 482 represents 2,4-D contamination inhibiting oxidation (i.e., removal) of CH<sub>4</sub> by methanotrophs causing
- 483 higher CH<sub>4</sub> emissions.
- 484 **Figure 2.** Conceptual diagrams of a wetland with methanogens, methanotrophs, and algae. Panel (A)
- 485 represents a balanced CH<sub>4</sub> cycle, where algae and methanogens produce CH<sub>4</sub>, methanotrophs oxidize
- 486 CH<sub>4</sub>; panel (**B**) represents an unbalanced CH<sub>4</sub> cycle where glyphosate and 2,4-D contamination
- 487 stimulate methanogens and algae and inhibit CH<sub>4</sub> oxidation, respectively, and thus result in higher
- 488 CH<sub>4</sub> emissions.