# 1 Beyond single-species models: leveraging multispecies forecasts to navigate the dynamics of

- 2 ecological predictability
- 3 Nicholas J. Clark<sup>1,2\*</sup>, S. K. Morgan Ernest<sup>3</sup>, Henry Senyondo<sup>3</sup>, Juniper L. Simonis<sup>3,4</sup>, Ethan P. White<sup>3</sup>,
- 4 Glenda M. Yenni<sup>3</sup>, K. A. N. K. Karunarathna<sup>1,2,5</sup>
- 5
- <sup>1</sup> School of Veterinary Science, Faculty of Science, The University of Queensland, Queensland 4343,
   Australia
- <sup>2</sup> UQ Spatial Epidemiology Laboratory, School of Veterinary Science, The University of Queensland,
   Gatton, Queensland 4343, Australia
- 10 <sup>3</sup> Wildlife Ecology and Conservation, University of Florida, Gainesville, Florida 32611, USA
- 11 <sup>4</sup> DAPPER Stats, 3519 NE 15th Avenue, Suite 467, Portland, Oregon 97212, USA
- 12 <sup>5</sup> Department of Mathematics, Faculty of Science, Eastern University, Sri Lanka

### 13

- 14 \*Corresponding author: Nicholas J Clark, <u>n.clark@uq.edu.au</u>
- 15
- 16 Short title: Multivariate ecological forecasting
- 17 Total word count (including references): 6622
- 18 Number of words in Abstract: 149
- 19 Number of References: 56
- 20 Number of Tables: 1
- 21 Number of Figures: 6
- 22
- 23 Authorship:

NJC, SKM and EPW designed the study; SKM and GMY oversaw field data collection; HS, JLS and EPW
 designed cyberinfrastructure to store and access data; NJC and KANKK performed statistical analyses
 and visualizations; NJC drafted the manuscript and all authors contributed to revisions.

27

## 28 Data availability statement:

- 29 All data from the Portal Project is publicly archived to Zenodo (Ernest et al. 2023) and is available in
- 30 processed forms using the portalr R package (Christensen et al. 2019b). R code to reproduce
- 31 analyses is provided in Supplementary materials and in a GitHub repository
- 32 (https://github.com/nicholasjclark/portal\_VAR). R code will be permanently archived on Zenodo on
- 33 acceptance of the manuscript.

#### 34 ABSTRACT

35 Forecasting the responses of natural populations to environmental change is a key priority in the 36 management of ecological systems. This is challenging because the dynamics of multispecies 37 ecological communities are influenced by many factors. Populations can exhibit complex, nonlinear 38 responses to environmental change, often over multiple temporal lags. In addition, biotic 39 interactions, and other sources of multi-species dependence, are major contributors to patterns of 40 population variation. Theory suggests that near-term ecological forecasts of population abundances 41 can be improved by modelling these dependencies, but empirical support for this idea is lacking. We 42 test whether models that learn from multiple species, both to estimate nonlinear environmental 43 effects and temporal interactions, improve ecological forecasts for a semi-arid rodent community. 44 Using Dynamic Generalized Additive Models, we analyze monthly captures for nine rodents over 25 45 years. Model comparisons provide strong evidence that multi-species dependencies improve both 46 hindcast and forecast performance, as models that captured these effects gave superior predictions 47 than models that ignored them. We show changes in abundance for some species can have delayed, nonlinear effects on others, and that lagged effects of temperature and vegetation greenness are 48 49 key drivers of change. Our findings highlight that multivariate models are useful not only to improve 50 near-term ecological forecasts but also to ask targeted questions about community dynamics.

51

#### 52 KEYWORDS

53 Biotic interactions, Community dynamics, Ecological forecasting, Generalized additive model, Stan,

54 State-Space model

#### 55 **INTRODUCTION**

56 Predicting the impacts of environmental change on ecosystem function and biodiversity is a global 57 challenge (Clark et al. 2001, Intergovernmental Science - Policy Platform on Biodiversity and 58 Ecosystem Services 2019, Fredston et al. 2023). Explicit predictions are needed to guide ecological 59 management decisions, inform monitoring programs, and perform scenario planning (Lindenmayer 60 et al. 2012, Tulloch et al. 2020). This has led to a growing emphasis on the importance of near-term 61 ecological forecasting to encourage greater reliance on ecological time series data, and on suitable 62 models that can handle the complexities of these data, to generate quantitative forecasts that can 63 be harnessed to guide management decisions (Dietze et al. 2018, Lewis et al. 2023, Karunarathna et 64 al. 2024). The applications of ecological forecasting are broad, including the prediction of soil 65 microbiome compositions (Averill et al. 2021), carbon cycle dynamics (Dietze et al. 2014) and 66 species' population dynamics (Ward et al. 2014, White et al. 2019, Johnson-Bice et al. 2021).

67 Forecasts for species population dynamics are especially crucial for conservation planning, 68 stock assessments and other ecological management priorities. However, these forecasts typically 69 focus on only a single species at a time (Quinn 2003, Simonis et al. 2021, Lewis et al. 2022) or on 70 aggregate measures such as species richness, biomass or diversity (Algar et al. 2009, Tonkin et al. 71 2017, Clark et al. 2020). This is problematic because key applications of population dynamics 72 forecasts, including changes in ecosystem function and biodiversity loss, are rarely single-species 73 issues (Lindenmayer et al. 2012, Greenville et al. 2016). In addition, because species differ in their 74 niche requirements, ecosystems containing multiple species of interest may require managers to 75 balance competing needs not only between human and ecosystem requirements, but also among 76 different species (e.g., Romañach et al. 2022). Finally, species population dynamics are known to be 77 related to one another due to both direct interactions between species (e.g., competition) and 78 because species respond to shared environmental drivers (Volterra 1931, Warton et al. 2015, 79 Ovaskainen et al. 2017). These associations between the dynamics of different species has resulted

in extensive research into multivariate population dynamics models (Ives et al. 2003, Ward et al.
2010, Bunin 2017, Ward et al. 2022, Paniw et al. 2023). Leveraging these associations could
potentially result in more accurate forecasts from multispecies models and better-informed scenario
planning, including approaches to predicting the impacts of species extinctions or the potential
spread of invasive species (Ibáñez et al. 2009).

However, despite the potential advantages of multispecies dynamic models, their
implementation is still rare in ecological applications in general and in population forecasting
specifically. A recent review of 178 near-term ecological forecast applications, with targets ranging
from wildlife population trajectories to fisheries stocks and algal bloom forecasting, found that only
10 (5.6%) used multivariate models to generate and evaluate forecasts (Lewis et al. 2022). This
finding is in line with an earlier review of population dynamics models for informing marine reserve
design, which found that only 1 of 34 studies considered multi-species dynamics (Gerber et al. 2003).

92 The rarity of multispecies population dynamic forecasting is likely due in part to the 93 increased computational complexity and statistical knowledge needed to formulate multivariate 94 population dynamic models that incorporate real world complexities in ecological data (Karp et al. 95 2023). Forecasting the abundances of multiple species is particularly difficult, for several reasons. 96 Many biological and physiological processes influence population dynamics (Quinn 2003, Hampton 97 et al. 2013), and species often exhibit complex responses to external drivers (including non-linear 98 responses and lags; Cárdenas et al. 2021, Karunarathna et al. 2024). Moreover, temporal 99 autocorrelation is often prevalent in abundance time series data (due to population processes; lves 100 et al. 2010), which can be difficult to address in ecological models. Finally, because monitoring 101 wildlife is challenging, data complexities (e.g., irregular sampling intervals, observation errors, 102 missing samples, and overdispersed discrete counts with meaningful lower and/or upper bounds) 103 bring additional challenges into an already complicated modelling environment (Clark and Wells 104 2023). In combination, these issues often make population time-series data unsuitable for traditional

modelling approaches such as regression or simple time series models. Managers may also have
differing needs for forecasts, ranging from predicting the most accurate near-term population sizes
to exploring potential responses to differing management scenarios (Clark et al. 2001, Lindenmayer
et al. 2012, Moustahfid et al. 2021, Lewis et al. 2023).

109 One area of ecological modelling that has embraced multi-species approaches is Joint 110 Species Distribution Models (JSDMs), which leverage spatial patterns to predict the distribution of 111 species in space and time (Clark et al. 2016, Thorson et al. 2016, Norberg et al. 2019, Tobler et al. 112 2019, Powell-Romero et al. 2023). While many of these models only consider spatial data, recent 113 advances have included time-series structures that can learn multispecies dependencies (Ovaskainen et al. 2017, Abrego et al. 2021, Ruiz-Moreno et al. 2024). While forecasting multispecies population 114 115 dynamics remains challenging, these types of models have the potential to provide valuable insights 116 for forecast applications. Theory and experimental evidence support the idea that learning from 117 multiple species should improve population forecasts. For example, a recent experimental study induced changes in the abundance of competitors, resulting in altered species interactions that 118 119 impacted the accuracy of single-species forecasts (Dumandan et al. 2024). Other work has shown 120 that incorporating other species – either by including lagged observations of other species as 121 predictors in single-species models (Abrego et al. 2021, Daugaard et al. 2022) or by building 122 temporal JSDMs with multispecies autoregressive terms (Mutshinda et al. 2009, Hampton et al. 123 2013, Ovaskainen et al. 2017, Ruiz-Moreno et al. 2024) – improves the accuracy of ecological 124 predictions. But despite these findings, the broader use of multispecies forecasts as an ecological 125 application remains unexplored. Validation of multispecies forecasts, and comparisons against 126 forecasts from simpler single species models, have generally been limited to either in-sample 127 predictive measures (Sandal et al. 2022, Ruiz-Moreno et al. 2024) or one-step ahead correlation 128 measures (Ovaskainen et al. 2017, Abrego et al. 2021). We are not aware of any studies that 129 compare single species vs multispecies forecasts beyond a single time step. This is problematic 130 because most forecast applications typically require predicting multiple time steps into the future to

131 assess near-term management needs or responses to likely future scenarios (i.e. loss of important 132 species, shifts in important drivers). Moreover, most multispecies time series models fail to 133 incorporate one or more of the many important real-world complexities - observation errors, 134 missing values, non-linear responses to environmental drivers, and latent temporal dynamics – that 135 plague real-world forecasting applications (Royle and Nichols 2003, Holmes et al. 2014, Daugaard et 136 al. 2022, Clark and Wells 2023). This combination of a limited exploration of the utility of 137 multispecies models for ecological time series applications and the need to incorporate more 138 complex modeling structures constitutes a major gap in our ability to tackle realistic forecasting 139 applications.

140 Here we evaluate whether models that incorporate multi-species relationships can improve 141 near-term population forecasts using data from a long-term ecological monitoring study where there 142 is evidence of both direct biotic interactions between species (Heske et al. 1994, Ernest and Brown 143 2001, Lima et al. 2008, Bledsoe and Ernest 2019, Christensen et al. 2019a) and shared responses to 144 environmental factors (Christensen et al. 2018). Using the framework of Dynamic Generalized 145 Additive Models developed by Clark and Wells (2023), we build a series of models that learn species' 146 shared environmental responses and temporal dependencies to make inference about 147 environmental and biotic factors that relate to community dynamics. Our models highlight how 148 several key challenges can be tackled when modelling the dynamics of multiple species, including 149 how to estimate environmental effects that change nonlinearly over increasing lags, how to capture 150 unobserved temporal autocorrelation, and how to estimate lagged temporal dependencies among species. We then test whether the incorporation of these biotic dependence structures improves 151 152 forecasts compared to simpler single-species models over multiple near-term timescales (up to 12 153 months) using penalized in-sample performance criteria and out-of-sample forecast metrics. Finally, 154 we demonstrate how these models can be used to perform perturbation experiments for assessing 155 community responses to shifts in key species abundances and to changes in environmental drivers 156 with shared species responses. Because these multi-species dynamic models integrate both species

interactions and complex environmental dependencies, our study shows that they can provide a
deeper understanding of ecological dynamics while generating more accurate forecasts and
predictions for scenario planning. These models are broadly applicable to time-series data, providing
a versatile tool for conducting time-series based forecasting to meet the wide-ranging needs of both
basic and applied research.

162

#### 163 MATERIALS AND METHODS

We first describe the study system to outline why it is suitable for testing whether multi-species models lead to better ecological forecasts compared to single-species models. Second, we describe our full dynamic model, from which we can make inferences about the processes that drive community dynamics. Third, we describe how we compare this model to simpler models in an iterative forecasting exercise to ask whether models that include multi-species dependencies (a) improve in-sample fits to the observed data and (b) provide better out-of-sample near-term predictions.

171

#### 172 Rodent capture data

173 Our data come from the Portal Project, a long-term monitoring study of a desert rodent community 174 (Brown 1998, Ernest et al. 2020) that has been undergoing active forecasting since 2016 (White et al. 175 2019). The Portal Project is based in the Chihuahuan Desert near Portal, Arizona. The sampling 176 design includes 24 experimental plots (50m x 50m), each containing a grid of 49 baited traps (Brown 177 1998, Ernest et al. 2020). The design uses three experimental treatments. In control plots (N = 10), 178 holes in the fence are large enough to allow free access for all rodents. Full rodent removal plots (N 179 = 6) have fences with no holes. Kangaroo rat exclosures (N = 8) have fences with holes to allow 180 passage of all rodents except kangaroo rats (Dipodomys genus). Investigators close holes during

trapping to ensure all captured rodents are residents. Trapping follows the lunar monthly cycle, but
weather and other disruptions result in missing observations (~5% on average; Dumandan et al.
2023).

184 The Portal dataset exhibits many of the complexities that confront population forecasting. 185 These include observation errors due to imperfect detection, missing samples due to weather or 186 other issues (e.g., global pandemics), and overdispersed discrete counts for many species (20 rodent 187 species) that include large numbers of zeros and upper bounds set by the number of traps. 188 Environmental drivers, including temperature and measures of primary production, exhibit lagged 189 and nonlinear impacts on rodent breeding, activity rates, and population dynamics (Brown and 190 Ernest 2002). Moreover, the rodent species at Portal are known to compete for resources in 191 complex ways, and these biotic interactions are postulated to have important consequences for 192 variation in population dynamics. In other words, the Portal Project exhibits all the complexities that 193 make the ecological forecasting of species populations particularly difficult, making it an ideal real-194 world test case for exploring whether multi-species models can provide better near-term predictions 195 than single species models.

196 Open-source software exists to access the Portal Project data (Christensen et al. 2019b, 197 Simonis et al. 2022). We used the *portalr package* to extract trapping records from the Portal data (version 3.134.0; downloaded October 2022; https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.7255488). Our study 198 199 focused on rodent captures from the long-term control plots for the period December 1996 – August 200 2022. The data has records for 20 rodent species, but some are rarely captured. We excluded 201 species if they were observed in < 10% of trapping sessions. We did this to focus inferences on 202 species with the most influence on community dynamics. Each observation was a vector of total 203 captures on long-term control plots for the nine remaining species (Figure 1).

204



**Figure 1**: Rodent capture data from the Portal Project for the period December 1996 to August 2022.



205

206

#### 210 Covariate measurements

211 Rodent populations at Portal, and the associated number of captures recorded during sampling,

- 212 depend on environmental conditions that reflect resource availability and seasonal breeding signals.
- 213 We therefore modelled species' responses to environmental variation using minimum temperature
- and the Normalized Difference Vegetation Index (NDVI) as covariates. Hourly air temperature (°C) is
- 215 recorded by an automated weather station, while Landsat images are used to calculate NDVI
- 216 (accessed from the US Geological Service Earth Resources Observation and Science Center;
- 217 <u>https://www.usgs.gov/centers/eros</u>). Measurements for both covariates were converted to monthly
- 218 averages. We extracted covariate data from one year before the start of captures (from January
- 219 1995) so we could calculate lagged and moving average versions. See Ernest et al. (2020) for details.

#### 221 Model description

222 There were several aspects of the data we needed to consider when designing our model. Total 223 rodent captures showed both short- and long-term fluctuations (Supplementary Figure S1). Captures 224 for individual species also undulated over multi-annual cycles and were positively autocorrelated at 225 lags up to 20 months (Supplementary Figures S2 and S3). To test whether multi-species information 226 improves model performance, we needed to model these dynamics using a multivariate dependence structure. Second, we needed to leverage community information to estimate each species' time-227 228 delayed response to variation in vegetation and temperature. Because species' responses to 229 environmental change in this system are expected to be nonlinear (Brown and Ernest 2002), we used splines to model these responses. Rodent captures were modelled as *Poisson* observations of 230 a latent state model that was composed of a hierarchical GAM component (to capture shared 231 232 environmental responses) and a multivariate dynamic vector autoregressive component to capture 233 multispecies dependence. The full description for this model, which we abbreviate to **GAM-VAR**, is 234 shown in Figure 2.



Figure 2: Model definition and priors for the *GAM-VAR* model. Coloured boxes highlight the five
main components of the latent state model (*X*).

238

239 The GAM component of the model consisted of hierarchical NDVI and minimum 240 temperature effects. The structural forms of these functions were informed by theory and 241 exploration of covariate time series (shown in Supplementary Figures S4-5). We used a 12-month moving average of NDVI ( $NDVI_{MA12}$ ) because we expected rodents to respond gradually to 242 243 vegetation change. Our model assumed linear effects of NDVI<sub>MA12</sub>, equivalent to a hierarchical 244 slopes model. The partial pooling properties of this model allowed us to regularize weakly informed 245 slopes toward a community average. Responses to temperature were estimated using a hierarchical 246 distributed lag model in which nonlinear effects of minimum temperature varied smoothly with 247 increasing lag. These effects were constructed as tensor products of four cubic basis functions for lag 248 and three thin plate basis functions for minimum temperature. To allow our model to capitalize on 249 multi-species learning, we included a shared community-level response  $f_{alobal}(Mintemp, lag)$  and 250 species-level deviations  $f_{species[i]}(Mintemp, lag)$ . The sum of these effects allowed each species to 251 show a different temperature response from the wider community, but only if there was 252 information in the data to support such a deviation. We used lags of up to six months in the past.

253 A vector autoregression (VAR) of order 1 captured lagged multispecies dependence, where 254 A was a 9 x 9 matrix of autoregressive coefficients. Diagonal entries of A described densitydependence, or the effect of a species' dynamic process (at time t) on its own lagged values (at t - t255 256 1). Off-diagonals represented cross-dependencies that could provide useful biological insights into 257 interspecific interactions. For example, the entry in A[2,3] described the effect of species 3's 258 dynamic state at time t - 1 on the current state estimate for species 2 (at time t). To encourage 259 stability and prevent forecast variance from increasing indefinitely, we enforced stationarity 260 following methods described in Heaps (2023). Briefly, a multistep process was used to map the

constrained *A* matrix to unconstrained partial autocorrelations *P*. Process errors were allowed to be
 contemporaneously dependent to capture any unmodelled correlations. Priors for all model
 components are shown in Figure 2 and described in detail in the accompanying R code.

264

#### 265 Evaluating whether multi-species dependencies improve prediction performance

266 We formally tested whether learning from multiple species improved our model's predictions using 267 prediction-based model comparisons. To do so, we estimated a series of benchmark models that 268 acted as natural simplifications of the GAM-VAR by eliminating multi-species components in a 269 stepwise manner. The first benchmark model used the same HGAM linear predictor as the GAM-270 VAR but replaced the multi-species VAR(1) dynamics with an AR(1) process. This model (called GAM-271 **AR** in subsequent sections) eliminated the covariances and temporal cross-dependencies among 272 species' latent states, allowing us to ask whether the multivariate dynamic component was 273 supported for improving model fit. Next, we further simplified the **GAM-AR** by removing the 274 hierarchical environmental response functions from the linear predictor. This forced the model to 275 learn environmental responses for each species without using information from other species in the 276 data (GAM-AR no pooling). The final benchmark, referred to as AR, also used independent AR(1) 277 states but removed the GAM component entirely. Because this model only learned from past 278 observations, comparisons against it helped us understand how covariates impacted predictions and 279 inferences. Each candidate model was trained on all observations (through August 2022, N = 319 280 timepoints). Models were then compared using Pareto-smoothed importance sampling leave-one-281 out cross-validation (PSIS-LOO), a method that reweights posterior draws to estimate leave-one-out 282 pointwise prediction accuracy using Estimated Log Predictive Density (ELPD) values (Vehtari et al. 283 2017).

To adequately evaluate competing forecast models, it is also necessary to perform out-ofsample validation (Harris et al. 2018, Clark et al. 2022, Lewis et al. 2022). This is particularly

286 important because LOO-CV is designed to ask how models would generalize to new observations 287 within the training window. This metric does not evaluate a time series model's ability to forecast, as 288 information from future timepoints is used to influence predictions for previous time points. To 289 evaluate forecasts in a way that respected the temporal nature of our forecasting exercise, we used 290 exact leave-future-out cross-validation in an iterative expanding window framework. Models were 291 re-trained on the first 273 time points (~22 years), with the subsequent 12 time points (through 292 November 2019; selected to avoid a large sampling gap due to the COVID-19 pandemic) used to 293 evaluate forecasts. This allowed us to gauge how models might perform in a forecast scenario, but it 294 only provided a single comparison. To further scrutinize models, we retrained models on the first 75, 295 115, 154, 194, and 233 observations, and evaluated the subsequent 12 observations in each cross-296 validation fold. All forecast comparisons used an evenly weighted combination of two proper multivariate scoring rules. We chose the variogram score, which penalizes distributions that do not 297 298 adequately capture correlations in test observations, and the energy score, which ignores 299 correlations but penalizes forecasts if they are not well-calibrated (Scheuerer and Hamill 2015).

300

#### 301 Estimation

302 We estimated posterior distributions with Hamiltonian Monte Carlo in Stan (Carpenter et al. 2017, 303 Stan Development Team 2022), specifically the *cmdstanr* interface (Gabry and Češnovar 2021). 304 Stan's algorithms provide state-of-the-art diagnostics for probabilistic models (Betancourt 2017). For 305 example, Hamiltonian Markov chains diverged when attempting to estimate minimum temperature 306 deviations for some species in the GAM-VAR. Our data were not informative enough to learn how, 307 or even if, these species responded to temperature change in ways that differed from the 308 community response. Stan's diagnostics guided us to a model that could be reliably estimated, which 309 included deviation functions for the four most frequently captured species (D. ordii, D. merriami, 310 Onychomys torridus and C. penicillatus). Posteriors were processed in R 4.3.1 (R Core Team 2023)

with the *mvgam* R package (Clark and Wells 2023). Traceplots, rank normalized split-R and effective
sample sizes interrogated convergence of four parallel chains. Each chain was run for 500 warmup
and 1600 sampling iterations. R code to replicate all analyses and produce Figures is included in the
Supplementary materials and will be permanently archived on Zenodo on acceptance.

315

316 **RESULTS** 

#### 317 Modeling relationships among species improves prediction performance

318 Our data included total captures for nine rodent species over 319 time points. All models showed 319 adequate convergence and posterior exploration, and randomized quantile residuals showed no 320 obvious evidence of unmodelled temporal or systematic variation (Supplementary Figures S6 - S7). 321 However, in-sample performances differed, with models that leveraged multi-species information 322 producing higher ELPD scores compared to simpler models (Table 1). This was the case for all 323 stepwise comparisons apart from one: although the **GAM-AR**, which used partial pooling to learn 324 species' environmental responses, was favoured over the simpler GAM-AR no pooling, overlapping 325 ELPD standard errors suggested there was still large uncertainty about the magnitude of this 326 difference (Table 1).

327

Table 1: Approximate Pareto-smoothed importance sampling leave-one-out cross-validation (PSISLOO) was used to compute the Estimated Log Predictive Density (ELPD) of competing models. A
higher ELPD indicates a model is expected to generalize better to new data within the training
window.

Model	ELPD difference	SE of ELPD difference
GAM-VAR	0.0	0.0

GAM-AR	-15.5	8.3
GAM-AR no pooling	-22.1	7.0
AR	-74.3	12.6

We also found that forecast performance differed among models, with more complex multi-species models again tending to score higher for forecast performance than simpler models. Forecasts from the multi-species *GAM-VAR* were the most accurate when considering all validation points in aggregate and for 4 / 6 cross-validation folds (Figure 3; Supplementary Figure S8). The *GAM-AR* and *GAM-AR no pooling* models gave similar predictions and effectively tied for second in forecast performance, giving the most accurate forecasts in 2 / 6 cross-validation folds (Figure 3). The simplest *AR* model gave the worst forecasts.

340 The multi-species **GAM-VAR** model estimated large, positive autoregressive coefficients for 341 most species (diagonal entries in Supplementary Figure S9). It also relied strongly on information 342 from multiple species by estimating many non-zero cross-dependence effects (off-diagonal entries in 343 Supplementary Figure S9) and process error correlations (Supplementary Figure S10), which 344 provided structure that the model leveraged to accurately simulate historical dynamics. The model 345 recovered multiple notable transitions observed in the time-series including a major shift in 346 community composition around 2000 following the establishment of Bailey's pocket mouse C. 347 baileyi, and a second restructuring that happened following a drought in 2008 – 09 (Supplementary 348 Figure S11). It was these multispecies effects that enabled the **GAM-VAR** to produce more accurate 349 forecasts compared to the benchmarks. For example, Ord's kangaroo rat (D. ordii) and silky pocket 350 mouse (P. flavus) had negative cross-dependencies in the GAM-VAR, providing structure that the 351 model used to make predictions (Figure 4). The benchmarks, which ignored this structure, produced 352 smoother, less synchronous trends and wider uncertainties (Supplementary Figure S12). In the

353 following sections, we use simulations to briefly interpret each of the multi-species effects that



allowed the **GAM-VAR** to outperform simpler models.

356 Figure 3: Cross-validation forecast performances for three of the competing models (we do not show 357 metrics for the GAM-AR no pooling model as they were not clearly distinguishable from the GAM-358 AR metrics). Y-axis shows the log of the weighted variogram score, a scoring rule that penalizes 359 multivariate forecasts if they are not well calibrated and do not capture inter-series correlations in 360 observed data (lower scores are preferred). 12-step ahead predictions were evaluated over a 361 sequence of six evenly spaced origins. Points show individual forecast scores, with lower scores 362 indicating a better forecast. Lines show Loess smoothed trend lines. Missing points indicate that 363 sampling did not occur at the time point for that horizon.



Figure 4: Posterior latent state estimates (top panel) and posterior predictions (bottom two panels)
from the *GAM-VAR* model for Ord's kangaroo rat (*Dipodomys ordii*; in red) and silky pocket mouse
(*Perognathus flavus*; in blue) for the training and testing periods (demarked by the vertical dashed
line). State estimates were scaled to unit variance for comparisons. Ribbon shading shows posterior
empirical quantiles (90<sup>th</sup>, 60<sup>th</sup>, 40<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup>). Dark lines show posterior medians. Points show
observations.

373 Modeling relationships among species provides unique insights into community dynamics

374 Our cross-validation metrics strongly favoured the GAM-VAR and suggested that the multivariate 375 dynamic component was a particularly important driver of increased performance. Estimates of 376 process error were larger for the benchmarks than the **GAM-VAR** for nearly all species (Supplementary Figure S13), suggesting this model used additional information from multi-species 377 378 cross-dependencies to produce better predictions. But interpreting this cross-dependence is difficult 379 because VAR effects provide only a marginal view into the complex network of conditional 380 associations. We used impulse response functions (Lütkepohl 1990) to better understand the model. 381 These functions involve simulating an 'impulse' in captures for one species and then evaluating how 382 predicted captures for other species changed over the next six months (Figure 5). Following a 383 simulated impulse of three extra captures for Merriam's kangaroo rat (D. merriami), the model 384 expected some initial increases (due to the correlated process errors) followed by declines in 385 captures for most of the other species (Figure 5). The shapes of these declines varied by species. 386 Captures for the two pocket mouse species (C. baileyi and C. penicillatus) showed more immediate 387 declines, while the two grasshopper mouse species (O. leucogaster and O. torridus) declined more 388 gradually (Figure 5). In contrast, the other kangaroo rat species (D. ordii) was expected to increase 389 following a *D. merriami* pulse (Figure 5). Different effects were expected when changing the focal 390 species (Supplementary Figure S14)



Figure 5: Expected responses to a simulated pulse in captures of Merriam's kangaroo rat (*D. merriami*). Ribbon plots show how mean captures ( $\mu$ , on the log scale) are expected to change over the next six months if three additional *D. merriami* individuals are captured. Ribbons show posterior empirical quantiles (90<sup>th</sup>, 60<sup>th</sup>, 40<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup>). Dark red lines show posterior medians.

#### 397 Positive NDVI associations and hierarchical minimum temperature effects

We found broad support for positive  $NDVI_{MA12}$  associations (Figure 6). Conditional simulations, which asked how rodents might respond if moved from a relatively dry/brown vegetation state to a relatively moist/green vegetation state, gave higher probability to increased captures in the moist/green scenario for all species. But uncertainties about this effect varied. Greatest increases were expected for Ord's kangaroo rat (*D. ordii*), Western harvest mouse (*R. megalotis*) and cactus mouse (*Peromyscus eremicus*). The model was less confident about the direction of effect for Northern grasshopper mouse (*O. leucogaster*) and for one of the most dominant species in the study, Meriam's kangaroo rat (*D. merriami*). For these species, the model expected increases in
~70% of simulations and decreases in ~30% (Figure 6). While primary conclusions were generally
similar when using the *GAM-AR no pooling* model, which did not leverage multi-species learning,
the estimates of these contrasts were much more variable (Figure S15).

409



Figure 6: Posterior NDVI contrasts from the hierarchical slopes component of the *GAM-VAR* model. Histograms illustrate how much the expected number of captures,  $exp(\mu)$ , would change if the zscored NDVI 12-month moving average ( $NDVI_{MA12}$ ) changed from a relatively low value (-0.50) to a relatively high value (0.50). Numbers in each plot indicate the proportion of probability mass at or below zero (in blue) vs above zero (in red).

416

410

417 Interpreting minimum temperature distributed lag effects also required simulation. We visualized
418 1,000 simulated functions for each species using temperatures from 1997 (Figure S15). There was

419 large uncertainty in function shapes for all species except desert pocket mouse (C. penicillatus). 420 Captures for this species were expected to increase from May to October and decrease sharply in 421 winter. For seven of the other eight species, the model generally expected more captures in spring 422 (March – May) and fewer in late summer / autumn (July – October). But the shapes of these 423 responses varied. The two kangaroo rats (D. merriami and D. ordii) had smoother shapes that 424 decreased gradually from mid-summer to mid-winter. But the model expected D. ordii captures to 425 peak slightly later (May as opposed to March for D. merriami). The Southern grasshopper mouse (O. 426 torridus) was the only species that was expected to show higher captures in late autumn / early 427 winter (Figure S16). The five species that relied solely on the global function (O. leucogaster, C. 428 baileyi, P. eremicus, P. flavus and R. megalotis) were expected to show tighter spring peaks and 429 autumn troughs. When simulating from the GAM-AR no pooling model, the lack of multi-species 430 learning was immediately obvious. There was not enough information to learn nonlinear distributed 431 lag functions for these five species, with the model instead estimating flat functions centred on zero for all five species (Figure S17). 432

433

#### 434 DISCUSSION

435 Understanding and predicting change in species abundances requires models that capture realistic 436 biotic structure and address data complexities to produce near-term ecological forecasts (Hampton 437 et al. 2013, Holmes et al. 2014). Our results show that incorporating relationships between species 438 to estimate their lagged dependence, and to learn their potentially non-linear associations with 439 environmental drivers, yields more accurate in-sample and out-of-sample predictions. In addition to 440 improved quantitative forecasts, incorporating these multi-species complexities provides insights 441 into the dynamics of the system that could be important for scenario planning and other qualitative 442 forecasting approaches. For example, our dynamic VAR process uncovered biotic structure 443 representing a cascading network of relationships within the community. Captures for all species

increased with higher NDVI and responded nonlinearly to temperature change, but the shapes and
magnitudes of these responses differed across species. Our results show that models that describe
biological complexity, both through nonlinear covariate functions and multi-species dependence, are
useful both for generating more accurate near-term forecasts and for asking targeted questions
about drivers of ecological change (Ives et al. 2003, Greenville et al. 2016, Ovaskainen et al. 2017,
Pedersen et al. 2019).

450

#### 451 Leveraging relationships between species for ecological forecasting

452 Interactions and dependencies among multiple species are hypothesized to play pivotal roles in the 453 assembly of ecological communities and to broader ecosystem functions (Dobzhansky 1950, 454 Mutshinda et al. 2009, Mayfield and Stouffer 2017, Fecchio et al. 2019). This study shows why 455 models that target multi-species effects in both their environmental responses and their biotic 456 dependencies should also be strongly considered when studying community dynamics. Our 457 approach to constructing hierarchical dynamic GAMs and evaluating forecasts using multivariate 458 proper scoring rules offers a way to quantitatively assess multispecies forecasts and scrutinize their 459 value in real-world ecological forecasting applications. We also demonstrate how inferences from 460 these models provide deeper insights into why they may or may not perform better. For example, 461 the **GAM-VAR**'s process variance estimates were smaller than those from the benchmarks because it 462 used more information from the data. By learning about the relationships between species the 463 model could better capture both shared responses to environmental factors (e.g., a wet year in the 464 desert is good for most species) and direct temporal effects (e.g., competition for seeds). These 465 relationships between species can allow forecasts for less common species to borrow strength from 466 more common species, yielding better hindcasts and forecasts compared to simpler single-species 467 models. But like other multivariate autoregressive models (Ives et al. 2003, Holmes et al. 2014, 468 Hannaford et al. 2023) the VAR parameters of the GAM-VAR should not be interpreted as a species

interaction matrix, because these relationships can result from multiple sources (i.e., shared
environmental responses and direct interactions). While the parameters are not interpretable as
direct interactions, this approach does make it possible to gain a more detailed understanding of
population dynamics. Conducting simulations from this type of model allows exploring which species
have the strongest cascading effects, what changes might we expect if management increases or
decreases abundance for target species, and how these effects relate to regime transitions.

475 Our hierarchical modelling approach also makes it possible to partition variance among 476 observation error, environmental responses, and multispecies dependence to guide future efforts to 477 improve ecological forecasting. In our study, forecasts were dominated by uncertainty in the 478 dynamic process model, but using a vector autoregressive process allowed us to dissect this 479 uncertainty in meaningful ways (Lütkepohl 1990, Ives et al. 2003). Simulated responses to sudden 480 impulses in captures were often delayed and nonlinear. Despite the restriction to a VAR of lag of one 481 month, these responses resulted in cascading changes that lasted up to six months. Our model's 482 ability to simulate and dissect community change in this way offers a useful avenue for ecologists to 483 better understand, and expand on, theoretical predictions from both classical and more recent 484 empirical studies that have described strong interspecific interactions in ecological systems (Volterra 485 1931, Ebersole 1977, Mayfield and Stouffer 2017, Dumandan et al. 2024).

486

#### 487 Learning hierarchical nonlinear effects from community data

488 Our model captured linear, nonlinear, and lagged responses to environmental and climatic

489 covariates that were informed by data from all species at once. We found positive linear associations

490 between capture rates and a 12-month moving average of NDVI. This response was expected

491 because the rodents at Portal depend on plants for food and other resources (Brown and Ernest

- 492 2002, Ernest et al. 2020) and NDVI measures vegetation greenness in the landscape. Within this
- 493 overarching community pattern there were interesting patterns of variation in these responses

among species. The strongest positive association was shown by Ord's kangaroo rat (*D. ordii*), a
species that field evidence suggests consumes and harvests grasses (Kerley et al. 1997). In contrast,
Merriam's kangaroo rat (*D. merriami*) showed weaker associations with NDVI. This species has been
predicted to increase in prevalence in the study region with more severe droughts, in part due to a
preference for more open foraging habitat with less vegetation (Cárdenas et al. 2021).

499 Distributed lag functions determine the best combination of lags for environment covariates 500 but are not commonly used in ecology (but see Ogle et al. 2015, Wells et al. 2016, Karunarathna et 501 al. 2024). Our study shows how these effects can be learned hierarchically and provides useful 502 insights into delayed responses to temperature change for rodents at Portal. Most species showed 503 higher captures when minimum temperatures were low 3 – 4 months prior, suggesting increases 504 begin during mid to late spring when resources such as seeds become available. But others, such as 505 Merriam's kangaroo rat and Southern grasshopper mouse, showed increases during cooler months 506 in autumn and winter. Asynchronous phenology, where species show different reproductive timing, 507 is sometimes expected in competitive communities (Carter and Rudolf 2022). Analysis of individual 508 reproductive status in different biotic contexts suggests that some species shift their reproductive 509 timing in the presence of strong competitors in the Portal system (Dumandan et al. 2023). Do these 510 competitive forces play a role in seasonal capture variation over the long-term? Comparing 511 temperature responses on control vs experimental plots would be one interesting way to tackle this 512 question.

Interestingly, despite the relatively large number of observations our data contained for each species, estimates of environmental responses were still more precise and informative when using hierarchical models (which use partial pooling) as opposed to a no-pooling model that only considers species' effects in isolation. While hierarchical intercepts and slopes are commonly used in ecological models, there has been less emphasis on hierarchical nonlinear functions (but see Pedersen et al. 2019). Open access to new software that makes it easy to construct and estimate

these types of functions, such as the *mvgam* R package that we used here (Clark and Wells 2023),
should improve their uptake in ecological forecasting exercises.

521 But despite the power of hierarchical environmental effects to improve predictions, we 522 cannot interpret environmental response estimates as directly causal for several reasons. First, we 523 know NDVI is not a perfect measure of changes in seed production. Second, it is likely that changes 524 to NDVI and minimum temperature are both related to other unmeasured environmental drivers 525 that may also influence rodent abundance. Major storms, the El Niño Southern Oscillation and other 526 factors that influence moisture levels can all influence temperature and vegetation change (Sun and 527 Kafatos 2007). These other drivers could act as unmeasured confounds, biasing estimates in a causal inference framework (McElreath 2020). 528

529

#### 530 Future directions

531 Two additional steps would be useful to fully assess the value of multi-species models for ecological 532 forecasting, both in this system and more broadly as an ecological application. First, a more diverse 533 suite of candidate models could be estimated to determine how forecasts could be combined into 534 an ensemble to provide the best predictions in situations where prediction accuracy is the primary goal (Clark et al. 2022, Powell-Romero et al. 2023). This could be especially useful for detecting 535 536 changes in the system. For example, GAM-VAR gave better forecasts in most cross-validation tests, 537 but its performance was slightly worse than the simpler **GAM-AR** when the training window stopped 538 just prior to a major restructuring of rodent abundances that was taking place in response to a 539 drought. Second, determining which models are best for true forecasting requires evaluating 540 forecasts in the presence of uncertainty in future covariate values. In this study we were hindcasting and therefore used the actual observed environmental measurements for the period reserved for 541 542 model evaluation. Fortunately, the system is undergoing active forecasting involving a suite of 543 simpler models and leveraging actual forecasts for environmental covariates (White et al. 2019,

Simonis et al. 2022). A natural next step for this work is to compare the performance of the *GAM*-*VAR* model to simpler models both using hindcasting with observed covariates and when making
true forecasts relying on predictions instead of observations for NDVI and minimum temperature.

547 The Portal Project also provides a unique opportunity to disentangle the combined influence 548 of shared environmental responses and direct species interactions in driving observed relationships 549 between species. The site includes a long-term experimental manipulation where kangaroo rats 550 (Dipodomys species) are excluded from some plots. Recent work shows that single species 551 forecasting models for C. baileyi do not transfer well between the control plots and this 552 experimental manipulation, likely due to the different competitive environment experienced in the absence of the behaviorially dominant kangaroo rats (Dumandan et al. 2023). Multi-species models 553 554 like the GAM-VAR have the potential to transfer better in situations where one or more species are 555 removed from the system by accurately predicting the response of the other species to this removal. 556 Therefore, a key next step in evaluating the potential strengths of our models is to determine if they 557 can more effectively transfer to make accurate predictions on the plots with the experimentally 558 manipulated species composition. More broadly, we hope that the ability to estimate multi-species 559 dependence and species-level variation in nonlinear environmental responses result in more 560 accurate forecasts, inspire new questions, and lead to an improved understanding of the factors that 561 govern ecological community dynamics.

562

#### 563 ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We thank the many volunteers for their help during fieldwork to generate Portal data. This study
was supported by an ARC DECRA Fellowship to N.J. Clark (DE210101439) and USDA National Institute
of Food and Agriculture, Hatch Project FLA-WEC-005983 (Ernest) and FLA-WEC-005944 (White). The
Portal Project has been funded nearly continuously since 1977 by the National Science Foundation,
most recently by DEB-1929730 to S. K. M. Ernest and E.P. White. Development of portal software

- packages is supported by this NSF grant, NSF grant DEB-1622425 to S. K. M. Ernest, and the Gordon
- and Betty Moore Foundation's Data-Driven Discovery Initiative through Grant GBMF4563 to E. P.

571 White.

572

#### 573 SUPPORTING INFORMATION CAPTIONS

Figure S1: Total rodent captures from the Portal Project for the period December 1996 to August
2022. Counts represent total captures for nine species across long-term control plots, sampled at
each cycle of the lunar moon. Blanks represent missing values.

- 577 Figure S2: Autocorrelation functions of rodent capture time series in the Portal Project. Dashed lines
- 578 show values beyond which the autocorrelations are considered significantly different from zero.
- 579 Figure S3: Histograms of rodent capture time series in the Portal Project. Counts represent total

580 captures across long-term control plots, sampled at each cycle of the lunar moon.

- 581 Figure S4: Seasonal and Trend decomposition using Loess smoothing (STL) applied to observed
- 582 minimum temperature time series for the period December 1996 August 2022. The top panel
- shows the raw time series. The middle plot shows the estimated long-term trend (calculated using a
- Loess regression to the de-seasoned time series). The bottom plot shows the time-varying estimate
- of seasonality (calculated using a Loess regression that smooths across years). STL components were
- 586 estimated using the *msts()* function in the *forecast* R package (Hyndman and Khandakar 2008).
- 587 Figure S5: Top panel: observed Normalized Difference Vegetation Index (NDVI) time series for the
- 588 period December 1996 August 2022, with obvious seasonal fluctuations. Bottom panel: a 12-
- 589 month moving average that represents smooth, gradual changes in NDVI at the study site.
- 590 **Figure S6:** Autocorrelation functions of randomized quantile residuals from the **GAM-VAR** model.
- 591 Ribbon shading shows posterior empirical quantiles (90<sup>th</sup>, 60<sup>th</sup>, 40<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup>). Dark red lines show
- 592 posterior medians. Dashed lines show values beyond which the autocorrelations would be
- 593 considered significantly different from zero in a Frequentist paradigm.
- 594 **Figure S7:** Normal quantile-quantile plots of randomized quantile residuals from the **GAM-VAR**
- 595 model. Ribbon shading shows posterior empirical quantiles (90<sup>th</sup>, 60<sup>th</sup>, 40<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup>). Dark lines show
- 596 posterior medians.

- 597 **Figure S8**: Posterior predictions from the *GAM-VAR* model for the training and testing periods
- 598 (demarked by the vertical dashed line). Latent state estimates were scaled to unit variance for
- 599 comparisons. Ribbon shading shows posterior empirical quantiles (90<sup>th</sup>, 60<sup>th</sup>, 40<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup>). Dark
- 600 lines show posterior medians. Points show observations.
- 601 Figure S9: Posterior distributions of vector autoregressive coefficients (matrix A). Off-diagonals
- 602 represent cross-dependencies. For example, the entry in A[1,2] captures the effect of **DO**'s state at
- time t 1 on the current state estimate for **DM** (at time t). Diagonals (with grey shading) represent
- autoregressive coefficients (the effect of a species' state at time t 1 on its own state at time t).
- 605 Colours indicate the proportion of probability mass at or below zero (in blue) vs above zero (in red).
- 606 **DO**, Dipodomys merriami; **DO**, Dipodomys ordii; **OL**, Onychomys leucogaster; **OT**, Onychomys
- 607 torridus; PB, Chaetodipus baileyi; PE, Peromyscus eremicus; PF, Perognathus flavus; PP, Chaetodipus
- 608 *penicillatus;* **RM**, *Reithrodontomys megalotis*.
- 609 **Figure S10**: Posterior distributions for process error correlations (matrix *C*). Colours indicate the
- 610 proportion of probability mass at or below zero (in blue) vs above zero (in red). DO, Dipodomys
- 611 merriami; DO, Dipodomys ordii; OL, Onychomys leucogaster; OT, Onychomys torridus; PB,
- 612 Chaetodipus baileyi; **PE**, Peromyscus eremicus; **PF**, Perognathus flavus; **PP**, Chaetodipus penicillatus;
- 613 **RM**, *Reithrodontomys megalotis*.
- 614 Figure S11: Simulated rodent communities. Using the GAM-VAR model's posterior predictive
- 615 distribution, we simulated communities of 200 individuals at different timepoints to investigate how
- 616 well the model captured known community transitions. Colours represent different species
- 617 Figure S12: Posterior trend estimates from three competing models for Ord's kangaroo rat
- 618 (Dipodomys ordii; in red) and silky pocket mouse (Perognathus flavus; in blue). Trends were scaled to
- 619 unit variance for comparisons. Ribbon shading shows posterior empirical quantiles (90<sup>th</sup>, 60<sup>th</sup>, 40<sup>th</sup>
- 620 and 20<sup>th</sup>). Dark lines show posterior medians.
- 621 **Figure S13:** Posterior estimates of trend standard deviations from the three competing models.
- 622 Estimates are the square root of diagonal parameters from the trend covariance matrix ( $\Sigma_{VAR}$ ) for
- 623 the GAM-VAR (black), GAM-AR (red) and AR (blue).
- 624 **Figure S14:** Expected responses to a pulse in captures of the desert pocket mouse (*Chaetodipus*
- 625 *penicillatus*). Ribbon plots show how mean captures (μ, on the log scale) are expected to change
- 626 over the next six months if three additional *C. penicillatus* individuals are captured. Ribbon shading
- 627 shows posterior empirical quantiles (90th, 60th, 40th and 20th). Dark red lines show posterior
- 628 medians.

- 629 Figure S15: Conditional distributed lag minimum temperature functions from the hierarchical
- 630 smooth component of the GAM-VAR model, using temperatures observed in 1997. All other effects
- 631 were ignored. Functions for *O. leucogaster*, *C. baileyi*, *P. eremicus*, *P. flavus* and *R. megalotis* were
- 632 drawn solely from the global function. Functions for other species were the sum of the global
- 633 function and a species-specific deviation function. Estimates were scaled to unit variance for
- 634 comparisons. Ribbons show posterior empirical quantiles (90<sup>th</sup>, 60<sup>th</sup>, 40<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup>). Dark red lines
- 635 show posterior medians.
- 636 **Figure S16**: Conditional distributed lag minimum temperature functions from the independent
- 637 smooth component of the *GAM-AR no pooling* model, using temperatures observed in 1997. All
- 638 other effects were ignored. Functions for O. leucogaster, C. baileyi, P. eremicus, P. flavus and R.
- 639 *megalotis* were drawn solely from the global function. Functions for other species were the sum of
- 640 the global function and a species-specific deviation function. Estimates were scaled to unit variance
- 641 for comparisons. Ribbons show posterior empirical quantiles (90<sup>th</sup>, 60<sup>th</sup>, 40<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup>). Dark red lines
- 642 show posterior medians.
- 643

#### 644 **REFERENCES**

- Abrego, N., T. Roslin, T. Huotari, Y. Ji, N. M. Schmidt, J. Wang, D. W. Yu, and O. Ovaskainen. 2021.
   Accounting for species interactions is necessary for predicting how arctic arthropod
   communities respond to climate change. Ecography 44:885-896.
- Algar, A. C., H. M. Kharouba, E. R. Young, and J. T. Kerr. 2009. Predicting the future of species
   diversity: macroecological theory, climate change, and direct tests of alternative forecasting
   methods. Ecography 32:22-33.
- Averill, C., Z. R. Werbin, K. F. Atherton, J. M. Bhatnagar, and M. C. Dietze. 2021. Soil microbiome
   predictability increases with spatial and taxonomic scale. Nature Ecology & Evolution 5:747 756.
- 654 Betancourt, M. 2017. A conceptual introduction to Hamiltonian Monte Carlo. arXiv preprint 655 arXiv:1701.02434.
- Bledsoe, E. K., and S. M. Ernest. 2019. Temporal changes in species composition affect a ubiquitous
   species' use of habitat patches. Ecology **100**:e02869.
- Brown, J. H. 1998. The desert granivory experiments at portal. Pages 71-95 *in* W. J. Resetarits and J.
   Bernardo, editors. Experimental Ecology. Oxford University Press, Oxford, UK.
- Brown, J. H., and S. M. Ernest. 2002. Rain and rodents: complex dynamics of desert consumers:
  although water is the primary limiting resource in desert ecosystems, the relationship
  between rodent population dynamics and precipitation is complex and nonlinear. BioScience
  52:979-987.
- 664 Bunin, G. 2017. Ecological communities with Lotka-Volterra dynamics. Physical Review E **95**:042414.
- Cárdenas, P. A., E. Christensen, S. K. M. Ernest, D. C. Lightfoot, R. L. Schooley, P. Stapp, and J. A.
   Rudgers. 2021. Declines in rodent abundance and diversity track regional climate variability
   in North American drylands. Global Change Biology 27:4005-4023.
  - 29

- 668 Carpenter, B., A. Gelman, M. D. Hoffman, D. Lee, B. Goodrich, M. Betancourt, M. Brubaker, J. Guo, P.
  669 Li, and A. Riddell. 2017. Stan: A probabilistic programming language. Journal of Statistical
  670 Software **76**.
- 671 Carter, S. K., and V. H. Rudolf. 2022. Exploring conditions that strengthen or weaken the ecological
   672 and evolutionary consequences of phenological synchrony. The American Naturalist
   673 200:E189-E206.
- 674 Christensen, E. M., D. J. Harris, and S. Ernest. 2018. Long-term community change through multiple
   675 rapid transitions in a desert rodent community. Ecology **99**:1523-1529.
- 676 Christensen, E. M., G. L. Simpson, and S. Ernest. 2019a. Established rodent community delays
   677 recovery of dominant competitor following experimental disturbance. Proceedings of the
   678 Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 286:20192269.
- 679 Christensen, E. M., G. M. Yenni, H. Ye, J. L. Simonis, E. K. Bledsoe, R. Diaz, S. D. Taylor, E. P. White,
  680 and S. Ernest. 2019b. portalr: an R package for summarizing and using the Portal Project
  681 Data. Journal of Open Source Software 4:1098.
- 682 Clark, J. S., S. R. Carpenter, M. Barber, S. Collins, A. Dobson, J. A. Foley, D. M. Lodge, M. Pascual, R.
  683 Pielke, and W. Pizer. 2001. Ecological forecasts: an emerging imperative. Science 293:657684 660.
- Clark, N. J., J. T. Kerry, and C. I. Fraser. 2020. Rapid winter warming could disrupt coastal marine fish
   community structure. Nature Climate Change:DOI: 10.1038/s41558-41020-40838-41555.
- 687 Clark, N. J., T. Proboste, G. Weerasinghe, and R. J. Soares Magalhães. 2022. Near-term forecasting of
   688 companion animal tick paralysis incidence: An iterative ensemble model. PLoS
   689 Computational Biology 18:e1009874.
- Clark, N. J., and K. Wells. 2023. Dynamic generalised additive models (DGAMs) for forecasting
   discrete ecological time series. Methods in Ecology and Evolution 14:771-784.
- Clark, N. J., K. Wells, D. Dimitrov, and S. M. Clegg. 2016. Co-infections and environmental conditions
   drive the distributions of blood parasites in wild birds. Journal of Animal Ecology 85:1461 1470.
- Daugaard, U., S. B. Munch, D. Inauen, F. Pennekamp, and O. L. Petchey. 2022. Forecasting in the face
   of ecological complexity: Number and strength of species interactions determine forecast
   skill in ecological communities. Ecology Letters 25:1974-1985.
- Dietze, M. C., A. Fox, L. M. Beck-Johnson, J. L. Betancourt, M. B. Hooten, C. S. Jarnevich, T. H. Keitt,
   M. A. Kenney, C. M. Laney, and L. G. Larsen. 2018. Iterative near-term ecological forecasting:
   Needs, opportunities, and challenges. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences
   115:1424-1432.
- Dietze, M. C., S. P. Serbin, C. Davidson, A. R. Desai, X. Feng, R. Kelly, R. Kooper, D. LeBauer, J.
   Mantooth, and K. McHenry. 2014. A quantitative assessment of a terrestrial biosphere
   model's data needs across North American biomes. Journal of Geophysical Research:
   Biogeosciences 119:286-300.
- 706 Dobzhansky, T. 1950. Evolution in the tropics. American scientist **38**:209-221.
- Dumandan, P. K. T., J. L. Simonis, G. M. Yenni, S. K. M. Ernest, and E. P. White. 2024. Transferability
   of ecological forecasting models to novel biotic conditions in a long-term experimental
   study. bioRxiv:2023.2011.2001.565145.
- Dumandan, P. K. T., G. M. Yenni, and M. Ernest. 2023. Shifts in competitive structures can drive
   variation in species phenology. Ecology **104**:e4160.
- Ebersole, J. P. 1977. The adaptive significance of interspecific territoriality in the reef fish
   *Eupomacentrus leucostictus*. Ecology **58**:914-920.
- Frnest, S., and J. H. Brown. 2001. Delayed compensation for missing keystone species by
   colonization. Science 292:101-104.
- Frnest, S., G. M. Yenni, G. Allington, E. K. Bledsoe, E. M. Christensen, R. M. Diaz, K. Geluso, J. R.
  Goheen, Q. Guo, E. Heske, D. Kelt, J. M. Meiners, J. Munger, C. Restrepo, D. A. Samson, M. R.
  Schutzenhofer, M. Skupski, S. R. Supp, K. M. Thibault, S. D. Taylor, E. P. White, H. Ye, D. W.

- 719Davidson, J. H. Brown, and T. J. Valone. 2020. The Portal Project: a long-term study of a720Chihuahuan desert ecosystem. bioRxiv:332783.
- Fecchio, A., K. Wells, J. A. Bell, V. V. Tkach, H. L. Lutz, J. D. Weckstein, S. M. Clegg, and N. J. Clark.
   2019. Climate variation influences host specificity in avian malaria parasites. Ecology
   Letters:DOI:10.1111/ele.13215.
- Fredston, A. L., W. W. L. Cheung, T. L. Frölicher, Z. J. Kitchel, A. A. Maureaud, J. T. Thorson, A. Auber,
  B. Mérigot, J. Palacios-Abrantes, M. L. D. Palomares, L. Pecuchet, N. L. Shackell, and M. L.
  Pinsky. 2023. Marine heatwaves are not a dominant driver of change in demersal fishes.
  Nature 621:324-329.
- 728 Gabry, J., and R. Češnovar. 2021. Cmdstanr: R interface to 'CmdStan'. <u>https://mc-stan.org/cmdstanr</u>.
- Gerber, L. R., L. W. Botsford, A. Hastings, H. P. Possingham, S. D. Gaines, S. R. Palumbi, and S.
   Andelman. 2003. Population models for marine reserve design: a retrospective and
   prospective synthesis. Ecological Applications **13**:47-64.
- Greenville, A. C., G. M. Wardle, V. Nguyen, and C. R. Dickman. 2016. Population dynamics of desert
   mammals: similarities and contrasts within a multispecies assemblage. Ecosphere 7:e01343.
- Hampton, S. E., E. E. Holmes, L. P. Scheef, M. D. Scheuerell, S. L. Katz, D. E. Pendleton, and E. J. Ward.
  2013. Quantifying effects of abiotic and biotic drivers on community dynamics with
  multivariate autoregressive (MAR) models. Ecology **94**:2663-2669.
- Hannaford, N. E., S. E. Heaps, T. M. Nye, T. P. Curtis, B. Allen, A. Golightly, and D. J. Wilkinson. 2023.
  A sparse Bayesian hierarchical vector autoregressive model for microbial dynamics in a
  wastewater treatment plant. Computational Statistics & Data Analysis **179**:107659.
- Harris, D. J., S. D. Taylor, and E. P. White. 2018. Forecasting biodiversity in breeding birds using best
   practices. PeerJ 6:e4278.
- Heaps, S. E. 2023. Enforcing stationarity through the prior in vector autoregressions. Journal of
   Computational and Graphical Statistics **32**:74-83.
- Heske, E. J., J. H. Brown, and S. Mistry. 1994. Long-term experimental study of a Chihuahuan Desert
   rodent community: 13 years of competition. Ecology **75**:438-445.
- Holmes, E., E. Ward, and M. Scheuerell. 2014. Analysis of multivariate time-series using the MARSS
   package. NOAA Fisheries, Northwest Fisheries Science Center 2725:98112.
- Ibáñez, I., J. A. Silander Jr, A. M. Wilson, N. LaFleur, N. Tanaka, and I. Tsuyama. 2009. Multivariate
   forecasts of potential distributions of invasive plant species. Ecological Applications 19:359 375.
- Intergovernmental Science Policy Platform on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services. 2019. Global
   assessment report on biodiversity and ecosystem services of the Intergovernmental Science Policy Platform on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services. Bonn, Germany.
- Ives, A. R., K. C. Abbott, and N. L. Ziebarth. 2010. Analysis of ecological time series with ARMA (p, q)
   models. Ecology 91:858-871.
- Ives, A. R., B. Dennis, K. L. Cottingham, and S. R. Carpenter. 2003. Estimating community stability and
   ecological interactions from time-series data. Ecological Monographs **73**:301-330.
- Johnson-Bice, S. M., J. M. Ferguson, J. D. Erb, T. D. Gable, and S. K. Windels. 2021. Ecological
   forecasts reveal limitations of common model selection methods: predicting changes in
   beaver colony densities. Ecological Applications **31**:e02198.
- Karp, M. A., J. S. Link, M. Grezlik, S. Cadrin, G. Fay, P. Lynch, H. Townsend, R. D. Methot, G. D. Adams,
   and K. Blackhart. 2023. Increasing the uptake of multispecies models in fisheries
   management. ICES Journal of Marine Science 80:243-257.
- Karunarathna, K. A. N. K., K. Wells, and N. J. Clark. 2024. Modelling nonlinear responses of a desert
   rodent species to environmental change with hierarchical dynamic generalized additive
   models. Ecological Modelling **490**:110648.
- Kerley, G. I., W. G. Whitford, and F. R. Kay. 1997. Mechanisms for the keystone status of kangaroo
   rats: graminivory rather than granivory? Oecologia 111:422-428.

- Lewis, A. S., C. R. Rollinson, A. J. Allyn, J. Ashander, S. Brodie, C. B. Brookson, E. Collins, M. C. Dietze,
   A. S. Gallinat, and N. Juvigny-Khenafou. 2023. The power of forecasts to advance ecological
   theory. Methods in Ecology and Evolution 14:746-756.
- Lewis, A. S. L., W. M. Woelmer, H. L. Wander, D. W. Howard, J. W. Smith, R. P. McClure, M. E. Lofton,
   N. W. Hammond, R. S. Corrigan, R. Q. Thomas, and C. C. Carey. 2022. Increased adoption of
   best practices in ecological forecasting enables comparisons of forecastability. Ecological
   Applications **32**:e2500.
- Lima, M., S. M. Ernest, J. H. Brown, A. Belgrano, and N. C. Stenseth. 2008. Chihuahuan Desert kangaroo rats: nonlinear effects of population dynamics, competition, and rainfall. Ecology
   89:2594-2603.
- Lindenmayer, D. B., G. E. Likens, A. Andersen, D. Bowman, C. M. Bull, E. Burns, C. R. Dickman, A. A.
  Hoffmann, D. A. Keith, and M. J. Liddell. 2012. Value of long-term ecological studies. Austral
  Ecology 37:745-757.
- Lütkepohl, H. 1990. Asymptotic distributions of impulse response functions and forecast error
   variance decompositions of vector autoregressive models. The Review of Economics and
   Statistics:116-125.
- Mayfield, M. M., and D. B. Stouffer. 2017. Higher-order interactions capture unexplained complexity
   in diverse communities. Nature Ecology & Evolution 1:0062.
- McElreath, R. 2020. Statistical rethinking: A Bayesian course with examples in R and Stan. 2 edition.
   Chapman and Hall/CRC.
- Moustahfid, H., L. C. Hendrickson, A. Arkhipkin, G. J. Pierce, A. Gangopadhyay, H. Kidokoro, U.
   Markaida, C. Nigmatullin, W. H. Sauer, and P. Jereb. 2021. Ecological-fishery forecasting of
   squid stock dynamics under climate variability and change: review, challenges, and
   recommendations. Reviews in Fisheries Science & Aquaculture 29:682-705.
- Mutshinda, C. M., R. B. O'Hara, and I. P. Woiwod. 2009. What drives community dynamics?
   Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 276:2923-2929.
- Norberg, A., N. Abrego, F. G. Blanchet, F. R. Adler, B. J. Anderson, J. Anttila, M. B. Araújo, T. Dallas, D.
  Dunson, J. Elith, S. D. Foster, R. Fox, J. Franklin, W. Godsoe, A. Guisan, B. O'Hara, N. A. Hill, R.
  D. Holt, F. K. C. Hui, M. Husby, J. A. Kålås, A. Lehikoinen, M. Luoto, H. K. Mod, G. Newell, I.
- 798 Renner, T. Roslin, J. Soininen, W. Thuiller, J. Vanhatalo, D. Warton, M. White, N. E.
- Zimmermann, D. Gravel, and O. Ovaskainen. 2019. A comprehensive evaluation of predictive
  performance of 33 species distribution models at species and community levels. Ecological
  Monographs 89:e01370.
- Ogle, K., J. J. Barber, G. A. Barron-Gafford, L. P. Bentley, J. M. Young, T. E. Huxman, M. E. Loik, and D.
   T. Tissue. 2015. Quantifying ecological memory in plant and ecosystem processes. Ecology
   Letters 18:221-235.
- 805 Ovaskainen, O., G. Tikhonov, D. Dunson, V. Grøtan, S. Engen, B.-E. Sæther, and N. Abrego. 2017. How
   806 are species interactions structured in species-rich communities? A new method for analysing
   807 time-series data. Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences 284:20170768.
- Paniw, M., D. García-Callejas, F. Lloret, R. D. Bassar, J. Travis, and O. Godoy. 2023. Pathways to
   global-change effects on biodiversity: new opportunities for dynamically forecasting
- 810 demography and species interactions. Proceedings of the Royal Society B 290:20221494.
  811 Pedersen, E. J., D. L. Miller, G. L. Simpson, and N. Ross. 2019. Hierarchical generalized additive
  812 models in ecology: an introduction with mgcv. PeerJ 7:e6876.
- Powell-Romero, F., N. M. Fountain-Jones, A. Norberg, and N. J. Clark. 2023. Improving the
   predictability and interpretability of co-occurrence modelling through feature-based joint
   species distribution ensembles. Methods in Ecology and Evolution 14:146-164.
- Quinn, T. J. 2003. Ruminations on the development and future of population dynamics models in
   fisheries. Natural Resource Modeling 16:341-392.
- R Core Team. 2023. R: A language and environment for statistical computing. R Development Core
   Team, Vienna, Austria.

- Romañach, S. S., S. M. Haider, C. Hackett, M. McKelvy, and L. G. Pearlstine. 2022. Managing multiple
   species with conflicting needs in the Greater Everglades. Ecological Indicators 136:108669.
- Royle, J. A., and J. D. Nichols. 2003. Estimating abundance from repeated presence-absence data or
   point counts. Ecology 84.
- Ruiz-Moreno, A., M. J. Emslie, and S. R. Connolly. 2024. High response diversity and conspecific
   density-dependence, not species interactions, drive dynamics of coral reef fish communities.
   Ecology Letters 27:e14424.
- Sandal, L., V. Grøtan, B.-E. Sæther, R. P. Freckleton, D. G. Noble, and O. Ovaskainen. 2022. Effects of
   density, species interactions, and environmental stochasticity on the dynamics of British bird
   communities. Ecology 103:e3731.
- Scheuerer, M., and T. M. Hamill. 2015. Variogram-based proper scoring rules for probabilistic
   forecasts of multivariate quantities. Monthly Weather Review **143**:1321-1334.
- Simonis, J. L., E. P. White, and S. K. M. Ernest. 2021. Evaluating probabilistic ecological forecasts.
   Ecology 102:e03431.
- Simonis, J. L., G. M. Yenni, E. K. Bledsoe, E. M. Christensen, H. Senyondo, S. D. Taylor, H. Ye, E. P.
  White, and S. M. Ernest. 2022. portalcasting: Supporting automated forecasting of rodent
  populations. Journal of Open Source Software **7**:3220.
- Stan Development Team. 2022. Stan Modeling Language Users Guide and Reference Manual,
   Version 2.26.1. <u>https://mc-stan.org</u>.
- Sun, D., and M. Kafatos. 2007. Note on the NDVI-LST relationship and the use of temperature related drought indices over North America. Geophysical Research Letters 34.
- Thorson, J. T., J. N. Ianelli, E. A. Larsen, L. Ries, M. D. Scheuerell, C. Szuwalski, and E. F. Zipkin. 2016.
  Joint dynamic species distribution models: a tool for community ordination and spatiotemporal monitoring. Global Ecology and Biogeography 25:1144-1158.
- Tobler, M. W., M. Kéry, F. K. Hui, G. Guillera-Arroita, P. Knaus, and T. Sattler. 2019. Joint species
   distribution models with species correlations and imperfect detection. Ecology 100:e02754.
- Tonkin, J. D., M. T. Bogan, N. Bonada, B. Rios-Touma, and D. A. Lytle. 2017. Seasonality and
   predictability shape temporal species diversity. Ecology **98**:1201-1216.
- Tulloch, A. I., V. Hagger, and A. C. Greenville. 2020. Ecological forecasts to inform near-term
   management of threats to biodiversity. Global Change Biology 26:5816-5828.
- Vehtari, A., A. Gelman, and J. Gabry. 2017. Practical Bayesian model evaluation using leave-one-out
   cross-validation and WAIC. Statistics and computing 27:1413-1432.
- Volterra, V. 1931. Variations and fluctuations of the number of individuals in animal species living
   together. Animal ecology:412-433.
- Ward, E. J., H. Chirakkal, M. González-Suárez, D. Aurioles-Gamboa, E. E. Holmes, and L. Gerber. 2010.
  Inferring spatial structure from time-series data: using multivariate state-space models to
  detect metapopulation structure of California sea lions in the Gulf of California, Mexico.
  Journal of Applied Ecology **47**:47-56.
- Ward, E. J., E. E. Holmes, J. T. Thorson, and B. Collen. 2014. Complexity is costly: a meta-analysis of
   parametric and non-parametric methods for short-term population forecasting. Oikos
   123:652-661.
- Ward, E. J., K. Marshall, and M. D. Scheuerell. 2022. Regularizing priors for Bayesian VAR applications
   to large ecological datasets. PeerJ 10:e14332.
- Warton, D. I., F. G. Blanchet, R. B. O'Hara, O. Ovaskainen, S. Taskinen, S. C. Walker, and F. K. Hui.
  2015. So many variables: joint modeling in community ecology. Trends in Ecology &
  Evolution **30**:766-779.

# Wells, K., R. B. O'Hara, B. D. Cooke, G. J. Mutze, T. A. A. Prowse, and D. A. Fordham. 2016. Environmental effects and individual body condition drive seasonal fecundity of rabbits: identifying acute and lagged processes. Oecologia 181:853-864.

- 869 White, E. P., G. M. Yenni, S. D. Taylor, E. M. Christensen, E. K. Bledsoe, J. L. Simonis, and S. Ernest.
- 870 2019. Developing an automated iterative near-term forecasting system for an ecological
- 871 study. Methods in Ecology and Evolution **10**:332-344.